

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA
WAKE COUNTY

IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE
SUPERIOR COURT DIVISION
No. 24CV028888-910

REPUBLICAN NATIONAL
COMMITTEE; and NORTH
CAROLINA REPUBLICAN PARTY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NORTH CAROLINA STATE
BOARD OF ELECTIONS; ALAN
HIRSCH, JEFF CARMON, KEVIN
N. LEWIS, SIOBHAN O'DUFFY
MILLEN, STACY "FOUR" EGGERS
IV, in official capacity as members of
the NCSBE; and KAREN BRINSON
BELL, in official capacity as
Executive Director of the NCSBE,

Defendants,

and

DEMOCRATIC NATIONAL
COMMITTEE, and AFFIRMATIVE
ACTION COALITION,

Intervenor-Defendants.

**INTERVENOR-DEFENDANT THE DEMOCRATIC NATIONAL
COMMITTEE'S BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO DISMISS FOR
LACK OF SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION OR FOR JUDGMENT ON
THE PLEADINGS FOR LACK OF SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION**

INTRODUCTION

“As a general proposition, cases that have become moot should be dismissed.” *Chavez v. McFadden*, 374 N.C. 458, 467 (2020). This litigation is now moot. Plaintiffs filed their complaint in September 2024, seeking to enjoin the North Carolina State Board of Elections and North Carolina’s county boards of elections from accepting a digital University of North Carolina student or employee card as identification for voting. The State Board’s approval of a digital identification card lapsed at the end of 2024, and Plaintiffs have not shown that digital student or employee identification cards have been submitted to the State Board for approval or that the State Board will approve digital cards for use in future elections. Because there is no dispute left in this litigation, this Court should dismiss the matter as moot.

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

The allegations in Plaintiffs’ Complaint, along with the subsequent factual developments mooting this case, can be summarized as follows.

A. Plaintiffs’ Allegations.

Last August, the North Carolina State Board of Elections voted “to accept electronic student and employee identification documents from UNC as saved on a computer system and produced to a precinct official on a computer device.” (Compl. ¶¶ 1, 59–61, 6–64.) The State Board took the position that UNC’s digital identification card (known as the “Mobile OneCard”) met the requirements to be accepted as photo identification under N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.17 and 163-166.18. (Compl. ¶ 61.)

Plaintiffs disagreed with the State Board’s interpretation of N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.17 and 163-166.18, arguing that voter identification cards must be

physically tangible. (*See generally* Compl. ¶¶ 21–57.) Plaintiffs speculated that “allow[ing] the use of unlawful electronic voter photo” could “allow hundreds or thousands of ineligible voters to vote.” (*Id.* ¶¶ 68, 78–79, 84, 86.)

B. Procedural Background.

Plaintiffs filed their Complaint and moved for a temporary restraining order or preliminary injunction to prevent State elections officials from accepting the Mobile OneCard as valid identification. The trial court denied Plaintiffs’ motion on September 20, 2024. Plaintiffs then filed a notice of appeal and petitioned the Court of Appeals for a writ of supersedeas, stay, and temporary injunction.

The Court of Appeals granted Plaintiffs’ petition and enjoined the State Board’s approval of the Mobile OneCard or any other digital identification card for use as voter identification in the 2024 general election. Appendix A, N.C. App. Am. Order No. P24-660 (Sept. 30, 2024). The Court of Appeals’ injunction remained in effect until January 2025, when Plaintiffs dismissed their appeal. Appendix B, N.C. App. Order No. 25-3 (Jan. 9, 2025). But in this Court, Plaintiffs have declined to dismiss this litigation entirely. Accordingly, Intervenor-Defendant, the Democratic National Committee (“DNC”) moved to dismiss the case.

C. Additional Factual Developments.

All State Board approvals of student and employee identification cards for use as voter identification in 2023 and 2024 elections, including the approval of UNC’s digital identification cards, expired by operation of law on December 31, 2024. *See* N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.17(b), 163-166.18(b). Earlier this year, the State Board

accepted applications for photo identification to be used in 2025 and 2026 elections.

Appendix C, NCSBE, *New Photo ID Approval Period Opens for 2025 and 2026 Elections* (Jan. 31, 2025), available at <https://www.ncsbe.gov/news/press-releases/2025/01/31/new-photo-id-approval-period-opens-2025-and-2026-elections>.

No institution applied to the State Board seeking approval of a digital ID, including UNC. Appendix D, 2025/04/09 Email from State Board Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel. After the application period closed, the State Board approved nearly 100 student and employee identification cards for use in the 2025 and 2026 elections, none of which are digital identification cards. *See* Motion, Ex. A (2025 Voter ID Application Approvals); *see also* Appendix E, NCSBE, *State Board Approves IDs for Use in 2025 and 2026 Elections* (Apr. 24, 2025), available at <https://www.ncsbe.gov/news/press-releases/2025/04/24/state-board-approves-ids-use-2025-and-2026-elections>.¹

In May, five new appointees to the State Board (three Republicans and two Democrats) were sworn into four-year terms. Appendix F, NCSBE, *New State Board Sworn In, Chairman Elected, Executive Director Appointed* (May 7, 2025), available

¹ The DNC respectfully requests that the Court take judicial notice of the appended press releases of the State Board, the contents of which are a matter of public record. *See, e.g., State ex rel. Utilities Comm'n v. S. Bell Tel. & Tel. Co.*, 289 N.C. 286, 287, 221 S.E.2d 322, 323-24 (1976); *Comm'r of Ins. v. N.C. Auto. Rate Admin. Office*, 293 N.C. 365, 381, 239 S.E.2d 48, 58 (1977) (judicially noticing the North Carolina Rate Bureau's filing with the Commissioner of Insurance); *Chavez v. Carmichael*, 822 S.E.2d 131, 138-39 (N.C. Ct. App. 2018) (judicially noticing interagency agreement), *aff'd in part, rev'd in part*, 374 N.C. 458, 843 S.E.2d 139 (2020) (relying on noticed document); *W. R. Co. v. N.C. Prop. Tax Comm'n*, 48 N.C. App. 245, 261, 269 S.E.2d 636, 645 (1980) (noting the court could judicially notice corporate documents filed with secretary of state).

at <https://www.ncsbe.gov/news/press-releases/2025/05/07/new-state-board-sworn-chairman-elected-executive-director-appointed>.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

“If a court finds at any stage of the proceedings that it lacks jurisdiction over the subject matter of the case, it must dismiss the case for want of jurisdiction.” *Time Warner Entm’t Advance/Newhouse P’ship v. Town of Landis*, 228 N.C. App. 510, 514 (2013) (quoting *Sarda v. City/Cty. of Durham Bd. of Adjustment*, 156 N.C. App. 213, 215 (2003)); accord N.C. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1), 12(h)(3). Plaintiffs bear the burden of proving the Court has subject matter jurisdiction. *Harper v. City of Asheville*, 160 N.C. App. 209, 217 (2003). When reviewing a motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction, this Court may consider and weigh matters outside the pleadings. *Smith v. Privette*, 128 N.C. App. 490, 493 (1998). “Because a moot claim is not justiciable, and a trial court does not have subject matter jurisdiction over a non-justiciable claim, mootness is properly raised through a motion under [Rule 12(b)(1)].” *Yeager v. Yeager*, 228 N.C. App. 562, 565 (2013).²

ARGUMENT

A case is moot “when a determination is sought on a matter which, when rendered, cannot have any practical effect on the existing controversy.” *Roberts v. Madison Cty. Realtors Ass’n*, 344 N.C. 394, 398–99 (1996). “Mootness arises

² “A motion to dismiss under Rule 12(b)(1) for lack of subject matter jurisdiction may be raised at any time.” *Hentz v. Asheville City Bd. of Educ.*, 189 N.C. App. 520, 522 (2008). To ensure this Court can reach the merits of its request to end this litigation, the DNC moved in the alternative for judgment on the pleadings on the same grounds because it has already answered. N.C. R. Civ. P. 12(c).

whenever, during the course of litigation it develops . . . that the questions originally in controversy between the parties are no longer at issue.” *Gray Media Grp. v. City of Charlotte through City Counsel*, 290 N.C. App. 384, 389 (2023) (citation modified). When either condition occurs, the case must be dismissed. *In re Peoples*, 296 N.C. 109, 147 (1978). “Courts will not entertain [moot] cases because it is not the responsibility of courts to decide ‘abstract propositions of law.’” *Lange v. Lange*, 357 N.C. 645, 647 (2003) (quoting *In re Peoples*, 296 N.C. at 147).

The Complaint concerns the State Board’s approval of the use of the UNC Mobile OneCard as voter identification in the 2024 general election. That election is now over. And Plaintiffs have not alleged that third parties will submit digital identification for State Board approval in 2025, 2026, or thereafter, let alone that the State Board will approve use of digital identification for use in future elections. Therefore, this case is moot and must be dismissed.

A. Plaintiffs have obtained complete relief against use of the UNC Mobile OneCard in the 2024 general election.

This case is moot because it concerns facts applicable only to an election that has come and gone. The State Board approved use of the UNC Mobile OneCard as voter identification in the 2024 presidential general election. (Compl. ¶¶ 59, 79, 84, 86.) Plaintiffs argued that this approval violated North Carolina law and speculated that, if UNC students and employees were allowed to use their Mobile OneCard as voter identification, “ineligible voters” could cast their ballots in that election. (*Id.* ¶¶ 1, 59, 64, 68–69, 78–79.) Most notably, Plaintiffs’ Claim for Relief points only to

alleged harm related to the 2024 election. (*Id.* ¶ 86.) Ultimately, the Court of Appeals granted complete relief to Plaintiffs on this issue, ordering that:

The State Board of Elections is hereby enjoined from accepting the University of North Carolina – Chapel Hill Mobile One Card, or any other ‘image of a photo ID, either as a photocopy or a photo on a mobile device’ that is prohibited by the State Board of Election’s Numbered Memo 2023-03, for the purpose of casting a ballot in the November 2024 general election.

N.C. App. Am. Order No. P24-660 (Sept. 30, 2024). The Court of Appeals’ injunction remained in effect for the entirety of the 2024 general election; it was not dissolved until Plaintiffs’ interlocutory appeal was dismissed. N.C. App. Order No. 25-3 (Jan. 9, 2025). Thus, even Plaintiffs’ speculative allegations of a potential 2024 injury have been resolved.

B. There is no reasonable expectation that digital identification cards will be approved by the State Board for use in future elections.

Turning to the present day, this case has become moot. Legal issues can be “rendered moot by the passage of time,” as happened here. *E.g., Artis & Assocs. v. Auditore*, 154 N.C. App. 508, 511., 572 S.E.2d 198, 200 (2002); *Rug Dr., L.P. v. Prate*, 143 N.C. App. 343, 346 (2001). The State Board’s approval of UNC’s Mobile OneCard expired on December 31, 2024. *See* N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.17(b), 163-166.18(b). Thus, the only digital identification card previously approved by the State Board can no longer be used. And Plaintiffs have not carried their burden to show that digital student or employee identification cards will be submitted for use in future elections, let alone that the State Board will approve them. Thus, “the questions originally in controversy between the parties are no longer at issue.” *Gray Media Grp.*, 290 N.C. App. at 389.

This is not a matter where a defendant has merely voluntarily ceased conduct alleged to be unlawful. *Cf. Thomas v. N.C. Dep't of Human Res.*, 124 N.C. App. 698, 706, 478 S.E.2d 816, 821 (1996). Rather, the challenged approval of the UNC Mobile OneCard expired by its own terms at the end of 2024. And there is no evidence before this Court that a third party submitted digital identification for approved use in 2025 or 2026 or will do so in the future. Appendix D, 2025/04/09 Email from State Board Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel. Where the "voluntary acts of a third-party nondefendant" eliminate the need for relief, no exception to mootness applies. *Iron Arrow Honor Soc'y v. Hecker*, 464 U.S. 67, 72 (1983).

Nor is this matter capable of repetition yet evading review. To invoke this exception to mootness, Plaintiffs must establish a "reasonable expectation" that they will "be subjected to the same action again." *Crumpler v. Thornburg*, 92 N.C. App. 719, 723, 375 S.E.2d 708, 711 (1989). Plaintiffs cannot make such a showing because no entity has applied to use a digital student or employee identification card in North Carolina's 2025 or 2026 elections or expressed an intention to submit an application of that kind in any future election cycle. Appendix D, 2025/04/09 Email from State Board Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel. In turn, the State Board has not approved a digital student or employee identification card for use in North Carolina's 2025 or 2026 elections. *See* Motion, Ex. A. Fundamentally, the State Board (as newly composed) has not indicated that it will approve digital student or employee identification cards under N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 163-166.17 and 163-166.18 in the future.

CONCLUSION

The Democratic National Committee's motion to dismiss for lack of subject matter jurisdiction should be granted.

Respectfully submitted this 18th day of July, 2025.

/s/ William A. Robertson

JIM W. PHILLIPS, JR.

N.C. BAR NO. 12516

SHANA L. FULTON

N.C. BAR NO. 27836

ERIC M. DAVID

N.C. BAR NO. 38118

WILLIAM A. ROBERTSON

N.C. BAR NO. 53589

JAMES W. WHALEN

N.C. Bar No. 58477

BROOKS, PIERCE, MCLENDON

HUMPHREY & LEONARD, LLP

150 Fayetteville Street

1700 Wells Fargo Capitol Center

Raleigh, N.C. 27601

Phone: (919) 839-0300

Fax: (919) 839-0304

jphillips@brookspierce.com

sfulton@brookspierce.com

edavid@brookspierce.com

wrobertson@brookspierce.com

jwhalen@brookspierce.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The foregoing document was served upon the following counsel of record by email and using the Court's File & Serve System:

W. Ellis Boyle
docket@wardandsmith.com
weboyle@wardandsmith.com
Counsel for Plaintiffs

Terence Steed
tsteed@ncdoj.gov
Mary Lucasse
mlucasse@ncdoj.gov
Counsel for Defendants

Lalitha D. Madduri
lmadduri@elias.law
Narendra K. Ghosh
nghosh@pathlaw.com
*Counsel for Intervenor-Defendant
Affirmative Action Coalition*

This the 18th day of July, 2025.

/s/ William A. Robertson
William A. Robertson

APPENDIX

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Appendix A	N. C. App. Am. Order No. P24-660 (Sept. 30, 2024)
Appendix B	N.C. App. Order No. 25-3 (Jan. 9, 2025)
Appendix C	NCSBE, <i>New Photo ID Approval Period Opens for 2025 and 2026 Elections</i> (Jan. 31, 2025)
Appendix D	2025/04/09 Email from State Board Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel
Appendix E	NCSBE, <i>State Board Approves IDs for Use in 2025 and 2026 Elections</i> (Apr. 24, 2025)
Appendix F	NCSBE, <i>New State Board Sworn In, Chairman Elected, Executive Director Appointed</i> (May 7, 2025)

APPENDIX A

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM



North Carolina Court of Appeals

Phone: (919) 831-3600
Fax: (919) 831-3615
<https://www.nccourts.gov>

Eugene H. Soar, Clerk
Court of Appeals Building
One West Morgan Street
Raleigh, NC 27601

Mailing Address:
P. O. Box 2779
Raleigh, NC 27602

From Wake County
(24CV028888-910)

No. P24-660

REPUBLICAN NATIONAL COMMITTEE AND NORTH CAROLINA REPUBLICAN PARTY

v.

NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF ELECTIONS, ALAN HIRSCH, JEFF CARMON, KEVIN N. LEWIS, SIOBHAN O'DUFFY MILLEN, STACY FOUR EGGERS IV, IN OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS MEMBERS OF NCSBE, AND KAREN BRINSON BELL, IN OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF NCSBE

AMENDED ORDER

The following order was entered:

By unanimous vote, the "Petition for Writ of Supersedeas and Motions for Temporary Stay and Temporary Injunction" filed in this cause by petitioners Republican National Committee and North Carolina Republican Party on 20 September 2024 are decided as follows:

The petition for writ of supersedeas is allowed. The "Order on Plaintiffs' Motion for Temporary Restraining Order, or, in the Alternative, Expedited Preliminary Injunction" entered on 20 September 2024 by Judge Keith O. Gregory is hereby stayed. The motion for temporary injunction is allowed. The State Board of Elections is hereby enjoined from accepting the University of North Carolina - Chapel Hill Mobile One Card, or any other "image of a photo ID, either as a photocopy or a photo on a mobile device" that is prohibited by the State Board of Election's Numbered Memo 2023-03, for the purpose of casting a ballot in the November 2024 general election.

The stay and injunction will remain in effect until the disposition of petitioners' appeal or until further order of this Court.

The motion for temporary stay is dismissed as moot.

By order of the Court, sitting as a three-judge panel, this the 27th day of September 2024.

WITNESS my hand and the official seal of the North Carolina Court of Appeals, this the 30th day of September 2024.

Eugene H. Soar
Clerk, North Carolina Court of Appeals

Copy to:

Mr. William Ellis Boyle, Attorney at Law, For Republican National Committee and NC Republican Party - (By Email)

Mr. Narendra K. Ghosh, Attorney at Law, For Affirmative Action Coalition - (By Email)

Mr. Jim W. Phillips, Jr., Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Ms. Shana L. Fulton, Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Mr. Eric M. David, Attorney at Law, For Democratic National Committee - (By Email)

Mr. William A. Robertson, Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Mr. James W. Whalen, Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Mr. Terence Steed, Special Deputy Attorney General - (By Email)

Ms. Mary Carla Babb, Special Deputy Attorney General - (By Email)

Ms. Sarah G. Boyce, Deputy Attorney General, For North Carolina State Board of Elections - (By Email)

Mr. Jeffrey Loperfido, Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Mr. Trey Ellis, Solicitor General Fellow - (By Email)

The Honorable Clerk of Superior Court, Wake County

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

APPENDIX B

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM



North Carolina Court of Appeals

Phone: (919) 831-3600
Web: <https://www.nccourts.gov>

EUGENE H. SOAR, Clerk
Court of Appeals Building
One West Morgan Street
Raleigh, NC 27601

Mailing Address:
P. O. Box 2779
Raleigh, NC 27602

From Wake
(24CV028888-910)

No. 25-3

REPUBLICAN NATIONAL COMMITTEE
and NORTH CAROLINA REPUBLICAN
PARTY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF
ELECTIONS, et al.,

Defendants,

and

DEMOCRATIC NATIONAL COMMITTEE,
et al.,

Intervenor-Defendants.

ORDER

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 9th of January 2025 and designated 'Consent Motion to Dismiss Appeal' is allowed. Appeal dismissed. Plaintiff-Appellants to pay costs.

And it is considered and adjudged further, that Plaintiffs, do pay the costs of the appeal in this Court incurred, to wit, the sum of Nine and 00/100 Dollars (\$9.00), and execution issue therefor.

By order of the Court, sitting as a three-judge panel, this the 9th of January 2025.

WITNESS my hand and official seal this the 9th day of January 2025.

Eugene H. Soar
Clerk, North Carolina Court of Appeals

Copy to:

Mr. W. Ellis Boyle, Attorney at Law, For Republican National Committee, et al - (By Email)
Ms. Mary Carla Babb, Special Deputy Attorney General, For North Carolina State Board of Elections, et al - (By Email)
Mr. Trey A. Ellis, Solicitor General Fellow - (By Email)
Mr. Jim W. Phillips, Jr., Attorney at Law, For Democratic National Committee - (By Email)
Ms. Shana L. Fulton, Attorney at Law - (By Email)

Mr. Eric M. David, Attorney at Law - (By Email)
Mr. William A. Robertson, Attorney at Law - (By Email)
Mr. James W. Whalen, Attorney at Law - (By Email)
Mr. Narendra K. Ghosh, Attorney at Law, For Affirmative Action Coalition - (By Email)
The Honorable Clerk of Superior Court, Wake County

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

APPENDIX C

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

An official website of the State of North Carolina [How you know](#)



(/)



FRIDAY, JANUARY 31, 2025

New Photo ID Approval Period Opens for 2025 and 2026 Elections

All previous ID approvals expired on Dec. 31, 2024.

RALEIGH, N.C.

The State Board of Elections encourages eligible educational institutions and government agencies to apply to have their student and employee photo IDs approved for voting purposes in 2025 and 2026 elections in North Carolina.

All previous ID approvals expired on Dec. 31, 2024. The State Board will accept applications for new ID approvals from **Feb. 1 through April 1.**

To request approval for use in the 2025 municipal elections and 2026 primary and general elections, an institution must provide a signed approval form and a digital image of the ID card to the State Board on or before April 1, 2025. This year in North Carolina, municipal elections will be held in September, October, and November. Next year, the primary is in March and general election is in November.

Previously approved student or employee ID cards may not require an entirely new request for approval. If an institution's IDs (1) were approved by the State Board in 2023 or 2024, (2) contain an expiration date, and (3) have had no changes to the card since its approval, the institution will simply select the "Statement of No Changes" box on the approval form. No new digital image is required for an approved card with no changes.

Public colleges and universities may seek approval of both student and employee ID cards, but they must submit separate approval forms for each type of ID.

See the links below for submission instructions and ID approval request forms:

- [2025 Employee ID Application Instructions \(PDF\)](https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ)
(<https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ>)
- [2025 Student ID Application Instructions \(PDF\)](https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ)
(<https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ>)
- [2025 Employee ID Approval Request Form \(fillable PDF\)](https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ)
(<https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ>)
- [2025 Student ID Approval Request Form \(fillable PDF\)](https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ)
(<https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/Voter%20ID/2025%20Student%20and%20Employ>)

The Board will review submissions to ensure they comply with criteria in state law in April 2025, then publish a list of approved ID cards. Cards approved by the State Board will remain valid for use as a voter's photo ID through Dec. 31, 2026.

"In the last election cycle, more than 100 educational and government institutions had their IDs approved for voting purposes, and we hope that number increases in 2025," said Karen Brinson Bell, executive director of the State Board of

Elections. **“The State Board is ready to assist these schools and government agencies as they work through the approval process.”**

Photo ID Background

Voters in North Carolina are asked to present photo identification to vote. For more information on the photo ID requirement, see [Voter ID \(/voting/voter-id\)](#).

Student identification cards issued by North Carolina public or private universities and colleges, as well as employee identification cards issued by state and local government entities and charter schools, are valid forms of photo ID for voting when approved by the State Board.

Many other types of photo ID, including driver's licenses, also are accepted for voting.

State Board staff are in contact with education, employer, and advocacy partners to ensure details of the approval process are shared with all institutions.

Educational institutions and government agencies with questions about the process should email VoterID@ncsbe.gov (<mailto:VoterID@ncsbe.gov>) or call [\(919\) 814-0700](tel:+1-919-814-0700) (<tel:+1-919-814-0700>).

Related Topics:

- [Voter ID information \(/press-release-terms/voter-id-information\)](#)

CONTACT

Patrick Gannon

✉ patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov
(<mailto:patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov>)

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

APPENDIX D

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

Will Robertson

From: Steed, Terence <Tsteed@ncdoj.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, April 9, 2025 10:40 AM
To: W. Ellis Boyle
Cc: nghosh@pathlaw.com; lmadduri@eilias.law; Robert Golan-Vilella; Samuel Ward-Packard; Julie Zuckerbrod; Jim Phillips; Shana Fulton; Eric M. David; Will Robertson; James W. Whalen; seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com; daniel.volchok@wilmerhale.com; christopher.babbitt@wilmerhale.com; Michelle C. Howard; Alex C. Dale; gary.fox@wilmerhale.com; joseph.meyer@wilmerhale.com; jane.kessner@wilmerhale.com; nitisha.baronia@wilmerhale.com; Kimberly W. Overton
Subject: RNC v. NCSBE; Wake Superior; 24CV02888-910; Voluntary Dismissal

This Message Is From an External Sender

This email originated from outside the firm. Do not click links, open attachments or reply, unless you recognize the sender's email address and know the content is safe!

Ellis,

I hope you are doing well. I would like to raise again whether Petitioners will voluntarily dismiss this action.

As I noted in my email in early January when you decided to dismiss the appeal, all student and employee IDs previously approved by the State Board in the last election cycle expired on 12/31, including the digital UNC ID at issue in this case. G.S. 163-166.17(b) and -166.18(b).

On top of that, the application period for the current cycle closed at the end of last month, and I can confirm that no institution submitted an application to the State Board seeking approval of a digital ID, including UNC.

As a result, the case is moot for multiple reasons and further litigation serves no purpose.

Please let us know how you plan to proceed by the end of the week.

Thanks,



Terence Steed
Special Deputy Attorney General
North Carolina Department of Justice
Special Litigation Section
Phone: (919) 716-6567
tsteed@ncdoj.gov
114 W. Edenton St. Raleigh, NC 27603

Please note messages to or from this address may be public records.

APPENDIX E

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

An official website of the State of North Carolina [How you know](#)



(/)



THURSDAY, APRIL 24, 2025

State Board Approves IDs for Use in 2025 and 2026 Elections

The State Board of Elections has approved nearly 100 student and employee identification cards for use in the 2025 municipal elections and the 2026 primary and general elections in North Carolina.

RALEIGH, N.C.

The State Board of Elections has approved nearly 100 student and employee identification cards for use in the 2025 municipal elections and the 2026 primary and general elections in North Carolina.

These newly approved IDs include student IDs for all UNC System schools, as well as many other colleges and universities. They also include employee IDs for many educational institutions, as well as some county and local governments and charter schools. All approved IDs include a photograph, which can be used to confirm a person's identity when they check in to vote.

The list of approved IDs is available on the State Board's website at [Student and Public Employee IDs Approved for Voting](https://www.ncsbe.gov/voting/voter-id/student-and-public-employee-ids-approved-voting) (<https://www.ncsbe.gov/voting/voter-id/student-and-public-employee-ids-approved-voting>). They will remain valid for use as a

voter's photo ID through Dec. 31, 2026. The State Board may consider additional application periods for the 2026 elections.

All previous ID approvals expired on Dec. 31, 2024.

Beginning February 1 and ending April 1, the State Board sought applications from eligible educational institutions and government employers that wished to have their IDs approved for voting purposes.

State Board staff reviewed the submissions to ensure they complied with criteria in state law. The recommendations for approved IDs were provided to the five State Board members for review. No State Board member objected to the staff recommendations.

“We are grateful to the educational institutions and government agencies that applied to have their IDs approved,” said Karen Brinson Bell, State Board executive director. **“This gives voters additional ID options when casting their ballots.”**

This year in North Carolina, municipal elections will be held in September, October, and November. Next year, the primary is in March and general election is in November.

Voter Photo ID Background

In-person voters will be asked to show photo ID when voting.

Most voters will simply show their driver's license. But there are many other acceptable photo IDs. If an in-person voter does not provide an acceptable ID, the voter may fill out a Photo ID Exception Form and vote a provisional ballot, or vote a provisional ballot and

bring an acceptable ID to the county board of elections office by noon on the third day after the election.

Absentee-by-mail voters will be asked to include a photocopy of an ID with their ballot, or complete a Photo ID Exception Form for Absentee Voting and return it with their ballot. The photocopy will be mailed in an envelope that protects the voter's personal information on their ID.

If a registered voter does not have an acceptable photo ID, they can get one for free from their [county board of elections](#) (<https://vt.ncsbe.gov/BOEInfo/>). Learn more at [Get a Free Voter Photo ID](#) (<https://www.ncsbe.gov/voting/voter-id/get-free-voter-photo-id>). Voters can also get a free ID card from the N.C. Division of Motor Vehicles (NCDMV). Find more information under “No-Fee ID Cards” at [State IDs | NCDMV](#) (<https://www.ncdot.gov/dmv/license-id/identification/Pages/default.aspx>).

For more information on the photo ID requirement, including the current list of acceptable IDs, see [BringItNC.gov](#) (<https://bringitnc.gov/>).

Related Topics:

- [Board decisions](#)
(</press-release-terms/board-decisions>)
- [Laws/litigation](#)
(</press-release-terms/lawslitigation>)
- [Required by law](#)
(</press-release-terms/required-law>)
- [Voter ID information](#)
(</press-release-terms/voter-id-information>)

CONTACT

Patrick Gannon

✉ patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov
(<mailto:patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov>)

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

APPENDIX F

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

An official website of the State of North Carolina [How you know](#)



(/)



WEDNESDAY, MAY 7, 2025

New State Board Sworn In, Chairman Elected, Executive Director Appointed

RALEIGH, NC

The five new appointees to the NC State Board of Elections were sworn in to four-year terms on Wednesday, and immediately elected Francis X. De Luca of Wilmington as Board chairman. Member Stacy “Four” Eggers IV was then elected as Board secretary.

“It’s a great honor to be selected as chair of the North Carolina State Board of Elections,” De Luca said. “I look forward to engaging with my colleagues as we take on the administration of State Board business and operations. My focus as chairman will be to build and maintain the public’s confidence in elections. We want to follow the law, and make it easy to vote and hard to cheat.”

The State Board then appointed Sam Hayes as the state agency’s executive director, beginning May 15. Currently, Hayes is the general counsel for North Carolina House Speaker Destin Hall.

Hayes replaces Karen Brinson Bell, who was first appointed in 2019 and reappointed by the Board in 2021 and 2023.

Hayes becomes the fifth State Board executive director in state history.

[\[Watch a recording of the State Board meeting.](#)

[\]\(https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/State_Board_Meeting_Docs/2025-05-07/State%20Board%20of%20Elections%20Meeting%202025-05-07.mp4\)\]](https://s3.amazonaws.com/dl.ncsbe.gov/State_Board_Meeting_Docs/2025-05-07/State%20Board%20of%20Elections%20Meeting%202025-05-07.mp4)

Recently, State Auditor Dave Boliek appointed the five Board members who were sworn in Wednesday.

The Republican members, nominated by the chair of the North Carolina Republican Party, are:

De Luca of Wilmington, former president of the Civitas Institute. De Luca served in the United States Marine Corps for 30 years and retired with the rank of colonel. He is a former member of the State Ethics Commission.

Robert Rucho of Catawba County, a retired dentist and former state senator of nearly 17 years.

Stacy “Four” Eggers IV of Boone, managing partner of the Eggers Law Firm, who became a Board member in 2018 and was reappointed in October 2020 and May 2023. He formerly served on the Watauga County Board of Elections.

The Democratic members, nominated by the chair of the North Carolina Democratic Party, are:

Jeff Carmon of Snow Hill, a licensed attorney who has served on the State Board since 2019.

Siobhan O'Duffy Millen of Raleigh, a retired lawyer who served as a chief judge in a Raleigh precinct for 13 years. She has served on the State Board since 2023.

CONTACT

Patrick Gannon

✉ patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov
(<mailto:patrick.gannon@ncsbe.gov>)

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM