IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

NAVAJO NATION, a federally recognized Indian Tribe; NAVAJO NATION HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION; LORENZO BATES; JONNYE KAIBAH BEGAY; GLORIA ANN DENNISON; TRACY DEE RAYMOND and BESSIE YAZZIE WERITO,

Plaintiffs,

vs. No. CIV 22-0095 JB/JFR

SAN JUAN COUNTY, NEW MEXICO; SAN JUAN COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS; JOHN BECKSTEAD, in his official capacity as Chairman; TERRI FORTNER, in her official capacity as Commissioner; STEVE LANIER, in his official capacity as Commissioner; MICHAEL SULLIVAN, in his official capacity as Commissioner; GLOJEAN TODACHEENE, 10 her official capacity as Commissioner, and TANYA SHELBY, in her official capacity as County Clerk,

Defendants.

ORDER

THIS MATTER comes before the Court on Defendants' Motion to Dismiss: Rule 12(B)(1) Dismissal for Lack of Standing of Putative Plaintiff Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission, filed July 10, 2023 (Doc. 100)("MTD"). The Court held a hearing on August 15, 2023. See Clerk's Minutes, filed August 15, 2023 (Doc. 157). The primary issue is whether the Court should dismiss Plaintiff Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission (the "Rights Commission") from this case, because the Rights Commission lacks standing. For the reasons

stated on the record at the hearing, the Court grants the MTD. <u>See</u> Draft Transcript of Hearing at 13:9-15 (taken August 15, 2023)(Court).¹

IT IS ORDERED that: (i) the Defendants' Motion to Dismiss: Rule 12(B)(1) Dismissal for Lack of Standing of Putative Plaintiff Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission, filed July 10, 2023 (Doc. 100), is granted; and (ii) Plaintiff Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission is dismissed without prejudice.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Counsel:

Ethel Branch
Attorney General
Doreen N. McPaul
Louis I. Mallette, IV
Paul Spruhan
Katherine Belzowski
Attorneys
Navajo Nation Department of Justice
Window Rock, Arizona

-- and --

Alexander B. Giraldo DLA Piper, LLP Los Angeles, California

-- and --

Danielle Nettles

¹The Court's citations to the transcript of the hearing refer to the court reporter's original, unedited version. Any final transcript may contain slightly different page and/or line numbers.

DLA Piper, LLP East Palo Alto, California

-- and --

Danielle T. Morrison Jean C. Gabat Raymond M. Williams DLA Piper, LLP Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

-- and --

Tamara H. Sakijha DLA Piper, LLP New York, New York

-- and --

Virginia Weeks DLA Piper, LLP Seattle, Washington

-- and --

Bernadette Reyes Sonni Waknin UCLA Voting Rights Project Los Angeles, California

-- and --

Chad W. Dunn Brazil & Dunn Austin, Texas

-- and --

Ezra D. Rosenberg Ryan Snow Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law Washington, District of Columbia

-- and --

Leon F. Howard, III

Preston Sanchez ACLU of New Mexico Albuquerque, New Mexico

Attorneys for the Plaintiffs

Brian Griesmeyer Christopher T. Saucedo Saucedo Chavez, PC Albuquerque, New Mexico

Attorneys for the Defendants

PAEL LATER HELD FOR WHITE HE WHITE HELD FOR WHITE H