SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF ALBANY

ELISE STEFANIK, NICOLE MALLIOTAKIS, NICHOLAS LANGWORTHY, CLAUDIA TENNEY, ANDREW GOODELL, MICHAEL SIGLER, PETER KING, GAIL TEAL, DOUGLAS COLETY, BRENT BOGARDUS, MARK E. SMITH, THOMAS A. NICHOLS, MARY LOU A. MONAHAN, ROBERT F. HOLDEN, CARLA KERR STEARNS, JERRY FISHMAN, NEW YORK REPUBLICAN STATE COMMITTEE, CONSERVATIVE PARTY OF NEW YORK STATE, NATIONAL REPUBLICAN CONGRESSIONAL COMMITTEE, REPUBLICAN NATIONAL COMMITTEE,

Hon. Christina L. Ryba Supreme Court Justice

> DECISION/ORDER Index No. 908840-23

Plaintiffs,

-against-

KATHY HOCHUL, in her official capacity as Governor of New York; NEW YORK STATE BOARD OF ELECTIONS; PETER S. KOSINSKI, in his official capacity as Co-Chair of the New York State Board of Elections; DOUGLAS A. KELLNER, in his official capacity as Co-Chair of the New York State Board of Elections; and THE STATE OF NEW YORK,

Defendants,

and

DCCC, KIRSTEN GILLIBRAND, YVETTE CLARKE, GRACE MENG, JOSEPH MORELLE, RITCHIE TORRES, JANICE STRAUSS, GEOFF STRAUSS, RIMA LISCUM, BARBARA WALSH, MICHAEL COLOMBO, and YVETTE VASQUEZ,

Intervenors-Defendants.

PRESENT: HON. CHRISTINA L. RYBA Supreme Court Justice

APPEARANCES:

Aria C. Branch Justin Baxenberg Richard Alexander Medina Marilyn Gabriela Robb Elias Law Group LLP Counsel for Intervenors-Defendants DCCC, Kirsten Gillibrand, Yvette Clarke, Grace Meng, Joseph Morelle, Ritchie Torres, Janice Strauss, Geoff Strauss, Rima Liscum, Barbara Walsh, Michael Colombo, and Yvette Vasquez 250 Massachusetts Ave NW, Suite 400 Washington, DC 20001

James R. Peluso Dreyer Boyajian LLP Counsel for Intervenors-Defendants 75 Columbia Street Albany, NY 12210

Cornelius D. Murray Michael Y. Hawrylchak O'Connell and Aronowitz, P.C.

Counsel for Plaintiffs Elise Stefanik, Nicole Malliotakis, Nicholas Langworthy, Claudia Tenney, Andrew Goodell, Michael Sigler, Peter King, Gail Teal, Douglas Colety, Brent Bogardus, Mark E. Smith, Thomas A. Nichols, Mary Lou A. Monahan, Robert F. Holden, Carla Kerr Stearns, Jerry Fishman, New York Republican State Committee. Conservative Party of New York State, National Republican Congressional Committee, and Republican National Committee 54 State Street Albany, NY 12207

Patrick Strawbridge Consovoy McCarthy PLLC *Counsel for Plaintiffs* Ten Post Office Square 8th Floor South, PMB #706 Boston, MA 02109

James F. Hasson Jeffery Hetzel Consovoy McCarthy PLLC *Counsel for Plaintiffs* 1600 Wilson Blvd., Ste. 700 Arlington, VA 22209

LETITIA JAMES Attorney General Matthew J. Gallagher Assistant Attorney General, of Counsel

2

Noah C. Engelhart Assistant Attorney General, of Counsel State of New York *Counsel for Defendants State of New York and Governor Kathy Hochul* The Capitol Albany, NY 12224

Brian L. Quail
New York State Board of Elections
Counsel for Douglas A. Kellner and Andrew J. Spano in their official capacities as Commissioners of the New York State Board of Elections
40 N. Pearl Street, Suite 5
Albany, NY 12207

Nicholas J. Faso Christopher E. Buckey Deborah N. Misir Cullen and Dykman LLP Counsel for Defendant Peter S. Kosinski, in his official capacity as Co-Chair of the New York State Board of Elections 80 State Street, Suite 900 Albany, New York 12207 Kevin G. Murphy

Kevin G. Murphy New York State Board of Elections Counsel for Anthony J. Casale in his official capacity as Commissioner of the New York State Board of Elections 40 N. Pearl Street, Suite 5 Albany, NY 12207

UPON the filing and reading of the Notice of Motion to Intervene by DCCC, Kirsten Gillibrand, Yvette Clarke, Grace Meng, Joseph Morelle, Ritchie Torres, Janice Strauss, Geoff Strauss, Rima Liscum, Barbara Walsh, Michael Colombo, and Yvette Vasquez (collectively, "Proposed Intervenors"); the Affirmation of Marilyn Gabriela Robb dated September 29, 2023 and the exhibits attached thereto; and the Proposed Intervenors' Memorandum of Law, all in support of said Motion; and

WHEREAS all of the parties having appeared before the Court on October 13, 2023;

WHEREAS no opposition to the Motion having been filed, served, or presented; and

WHEREAS in consideration of the foregoing and after due deliberation, it appears to the Court that the Proposed Intervenors are entitled to intervene pursuant to CPLR 1012(a)(2) and CPLR 1013;

NOW, it is hereby:

ORDERED, that the Motion to intervene is GRANTED in all respects.

The foregoing constitutes the Decision and Order of the Court. The Court is hereby uploading the original Decision and Order to the NYSCEF system for filing and entry by the County Clerk. Counsel is not relieved from service of notice of entry pursuant to CPLR 2220 and applicable rules of the court.

Dated: Jan 8, 2024

ENTER

HON. CHRISTINA L. RYBA Subreme Court Justice RETRIEVEDFROMDE

Hon. Christina L. Ryba Supreme Court Justice