

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE
NASHVILLE DIVISION**

TENNESSEE STATE CONFERENCE OF
THE NAACP, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WILLIAM B. LEE, in his official capacity as
Governor of the State of Tennessee, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:23-cv-00832

Judge Eric Murphy

Judge Eli Richardson

Judge Benita Pearson

JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS THE COMPLAINT

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

Defendants William B. Lee, in his official capacity as Governor of the State of Tennessee, Tre Hargett, in his official capacity as Secretary of State of the State of Tennessee, Mark Goins, in his official capacity as Coordinator of Elections for the State of Tennessee, the State Election Commission, and Donna Barrett, Judy Blackburn, Jimmy Eldridge, Mike McDonald, Secondra Meadows, Bennie Smith and Kent Younce, in their official capacities as members of the State Election Commission, move to dismiss the Complaint under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b).

This action should be dismissed for several reasons.

First, the Panel should dismiss the Complaint based on the equitable doctrine of laches. That doctrine can be applied in the redistricting context. And it should be applied here because Plaintiffs inexplicably delayed bringing their claims for over eighteen months—an unreasonable delay when seeking to remedy redistricting decisions. That delay caused the State to suffer evidentiary and expectations-based prejudice, core considerations that support applying laches to these claims.

Second, the Panel should dismiss the Complaint because it fails to state a claim. None of the racial gerrymandering claims are plausibly alleged because Plaintiffs do not even *try* to show how race predominated over the obvious partisan motivations for the district lines. Similarly, the purposeful discrimination claims are not plausible because Plaintiffs' allegations lack sufficient facts to overcome the presumption of good faith and establish racial animus and discriminatory effect.

Finally, at minimum, Governor Lee should be dismissed from this action. He is immune from suit under the Eleventh Amendment. Plaintiffs also lack standing to seek relief against him because he neither caused nor has the power to redress their injuries.

In support of this Motion, Defendants rely on the contemporaneously filed Memorandum of Law in Support of the Motion and the exhibit attached to the Memorandum.

Respectfully submitted,

JONATHAN SKRMETTI
Attorney General and Reporter

ADAM K. MORTARA (BPR# 40089)
Lawfair LLC
40 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 200
Nashville, TN 37215
(773) 750-7154
mortara@lawfairllc.com

/s/ Philip Hammersley
PHILIP HAMMERSLEY (BPR# 041111)
Assistant Solicitor General
WHITNEY D. HERMANDORFER (BPR# 041054)
Director of Strategic Litigation
MIRANDA H. JONES (BPR# 036070)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
RYAN NICOLE HENRY (BPR# 40028)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Tennessee Attorney General
P.O. Box 20207
Nashville, Tennessee 37202
(615) 532-2935
philip.hammersley@ag.tn.gov
whitney.hermendorfer@ag.tn.gov
miranda.jones@ag.tn.gov
ryan.henry@ag.tn.gov

Counsel for Defendants

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on October 10, 2023, the undersigned filed the foregoing document via this Court's electronic filing system, which sent notice of such filing to the following counsel of record:

COUNSEL OF RECORD	PARTY REPRESENTED
<p>Phillip F. Cramer Sperling & Slater 150 3rd Avenue South, Suite 1100 Nashville, TN 37201 Tel.: 312-224-1512 pcramer@sperling-law.com</p> <p>Jon Greenbaum Ezra D. Rosenberg Pooja Chaudhuri Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law 1500 K Street NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005 Tel.: 202-662-8600 jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org erosenberg@lawyerscommittee.org pchaudhuri@lawyerscommittee.org</p> <p>Jeffrey Loperfido Mitchell D. Brown Southern Coalition for Social Justice 1415 West Highway 54, Suite 101 Durham, NC 27707 Tel.: 919-323-3380 jeffloperfido@scsj.org mitchellbrown@scsj.org</p> <p>George E. Mastoris Michelle D. Tuma Winston & Strawn LLP 200 Park Avenue New York, NY 10166 Tel.: 212-294-6700 gmastoris@winston.com mtuma@winston.com <i>Counsel for Plaintiffs</i></p>	<p>Plaintiffs Tennessee State Conference of the NAACP, League of Women Voters of Tennessee, The Equity Alliance, Memphis A. Philip Randolph Institute, African American Clergy Collective of Tennessee, Judy Cummings, Brenda Gilmore, Ophelia Doe, Freda Player, and Ruby Powell-Dennis</p>

<p>Adam K. Mortara Lawfair LLC 40 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 200 Nashville, TN 37215 (773) 750-7154 mortara@lawfairllc.com</p> <p>Whitney D. Hermandorfer Director of Strategic Litigation Miranda H. Jones Senior Assistant Attorney General Ryan Nicole Henry Assistant Attorney General Philip Hammersley Assistant Solicitor General Office of the Tennessee Attorney General P.O. Box 20207 Nashville, Tennessee 37202 (615) 532-2935 whitney.hermandorfer@ag.tn.gov miranda.jones@ag.tn.gov ryan.henry@ag.tn.gov philip.hammersley@ag.tn.gov</p> <p><i>Counsel for Defendants</i></p>	<p>Defendants William B. Lee, in his official capacity as Governor of the State of Tennessee, Tre Hargett, in his official capacity as Secretary of State of the State of Tennessee, Mark Goins, in his official capacity as Coordinator of Elections for the State of Tennessee, the State Election Commission, and Donna Barrett, Judy Blackburn, Jimmy Eldridge, Mike McDonald, Secondra Meadows, Bennie Smith and Kent Younce, in their official capacities as members of the State Election Commission</p>
---	---

/s/ Philip Hammersley
PHILIP HAMMERSLEY (BPR# 041111)
Assistant Solicitor General
Counsel for Defendants