

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA
ERIE DIVISION**

BETTE EAKIN, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

ADAMS COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:22-cv-00340-SPB

PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Pursuant to the Court's January 10, 2023 order, *see* ECF No. 174 at 1, Plaintiffs respectfully move for adoption of the attached proposed protective order, which is identical to the one negotiated by the parties and proposed in the related case. *See* Unopposed Mot. in Support of Proposed Protective Order, *Pa. State Conf. of the NAACP v. Chapman*, No. 1:22-cv-339-SPB (W.D. Pa.), ECF No. ("Pa. NAACP Mot. for Protective Order").

Although Plaintiffs were not parties to the negotiated protective order in *Pennsylvania State Conference of the NAACP v. Chapman*, No. 1:22-cv-339-SPB (W.D. Pa.), Plaintiffs agree that the proposed protective order ensures that the parties can engage in efficient discovery while also preventing the public disclosure of confidential information such as voters' personal identifying information, and it ensures that the public keeps its right of access to judicial documents by requiring any party to obtain permission from the Court before filing any document under seal. Federal courts adjudicating civil litigation across the country commonly adopt this type of "umbrella" protective order to properly balance efficient discovery, the protection of confidential information, and the presumption of open judicial records. *See Cipollone v. Liggett Grp., Inc.*, 785 F.2d 1108, 1122–23 & n.18 (3d Cir. 1986). As such, Plaintiffs join and incorporate by reference

the motion for protective order submitted in the related case, to which all defendants in this action have agreed. *Pa. NAACP* Mot. for Protective Order at 3 (noting all parties consent to the entry of the proposed protective order). To the extent the Court grants the motion for protective order submitted in the related case, the Court should adopt that same order here.

Dated: February 3, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

Adam C. Bonin
THE LAW OFFICE OF ADAM C. BONIN
121 South Broad Street, Suite 400
Philadelphia, PA 19107
Telephone: (267) 242-5014
Facsimile: (215) 827-5300
adam@boninlaw.com

/s/ Uzoma N. Nkwonta
Uzoma N. Nkwonta*
Justin Baxenberg*
Daniel C. Osher*
Jacob D. Shelly*
Dan Cohen*
Daniela Lorenzo*
ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP
10 G St. NE, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20002
Telephone: (202) 968-4490
Facsimile: (202) 968-4498
unkwonta@elias.law
jbaxenberg@elias.law
dosher@elias.law
jshelly@elias.law
dcohen@elias.law
dlorenzo@elias.law

* *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

Counsel for Plaintiffs