### (ORDER LIST: 585 U.S.)

#### MONDAY, JUNE 25, 2018

## APPEAL -- SUMMARY DISPOSITION

17-1295 RUCHO, ROBERT A., ET AL. V. COMMON CAUSE, ET AL.

The judgment is vacated, and the case is remanded to the United States District Court for the Middle District of North Carolina for further consideration in light of *Gill* v. *Whitford*, 585 U. S. \_\_\_\_ (2018).

#### CERTIORARI -- SUMMARY DISPOSITIONS

16-9541 CLARK, JEFFREY V. LOUISIANA

The motion of petitioner for Teave to proceed *in forma*pauperis and the petition for a writ of certiorari are granted.

The judgment is vacated, and the case is remanded to the Supreme Court of Louisiana for further consideration in light of McCoy

v. Louisiana, 584 U. S. \_\_\_\_ (2018).

16-9608 RENTERIA-MARTINEZ, JOE H. V. UNITED STATES

The motion of petitioner for leave to proceed *in forma*pauperis and the petition for a writ of certiorari are granted.

The judgment is vacated, and the case is remanded to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit for further consideration in light of Rosales-Mireles v. United States, 585

U. S. \_\_\_\_ (2018).

17-108 ARLENE'S FLOWERS, INC., ET AL. V. WASHINGTON, ET AL.

The petition for a writ of certiorari is granted. The judgment is vacated, and the case is remanded to the Supreme Court of Washington for further consideration in light of

Masterpiece Cakeshop, Ltd. v. Colorado Civil Rights Comm'n, 584
U. S. \_\_\_\_ (2018).

- 17-6389 CRUZ-PENA, SIMON V. UNITED STATES
- 17-6556 ANTHONY, AVNIEL A. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-6805 AGUSTIN-GARCIA, JORGE V. UNITED STATES
- 17-7261 RUIZ-DOMINGUEZ, LUIS A. V. UNITED STATES

The motions of petitioners for leave to proceed *in forma*pauperis and the petitions for writs of certiorari are granted.

The judgments are vacated, and the cases are remanded to the

United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit for further consideration in light of Rosales-Mireles v. United States, 585

U. S. \_\_\_\_ (2018).

17-7779 JOHNSON, ORLANDO V. UNITED STATES

The motion of petitioner for leave to proceed *in forma* pauperis and the petition for a writ of certiorari are granted. The judgment is vacated, and the case is remanded to the United States Court of Appeals for the Sixth Circuit for further consideration in light of Sessions v. Dimaya, 584 U. S. \_\_\_\_\_ (2018).

- 17-7781 RAMIREZ GALVAN, JOSE L. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-7793 RAMIREZ-HIDALGO, JESUS V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8109 RUBIO-SORTO, JOSE M. V. UNITED STATES

The motions of petitioners for leave to proceed *in forma* pauperis and the petitions for writs of certiorari are granted. The judgments are vacated, and the cases are remanded to the United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit for further consideration in light of Sessions v. Dimaya, 584 U. S. \_\_\_\_\_ (2018).

### ORDERS IN PENDING CASES

17M131 DAO, KALIN T. V. UNITED STATES

The motion to direct the Clerk to file a petition for a writ of certiorari out of time is denied.

- 17-1165 DE CSEPEL, DAVID L., ET AL. V. REPUBLIC OF HUNGARY, ET AL.
- 17-1301 HARVEY, RYAN, ET AL. V. UTE INDIAN TRIBE, ET AL.

The Solicitor General is invited to file briefs in these cases expressing the views of the United States.

17-8084 KOCH, MARK A. V. SARGENT, NE

The motion of petitioner for reconsideration of order denying leave to proceed *in forma pauperis* is denied.

17-8616 HARNDEN, PAMELA S. V. MI DEPT. OF HEMS, ET AL.

The motion of petitioner for leave to proceed *in forma* pauperis is denied. Petitioner is allowed until July 16, 2018, within which to pay the cocketing fee required by Rule 38(a) and to submit a petition in compliance with Rule 33.1 of the Rules of this Court.

### **CERTIORARI GRANTED**

- 16-1094 SUDAN V. HARRISON, RICK, ET AL.
- 16-1498 WA DEPT. OF LICENSING V. COUGAR DEN, INC.

The petitions for writs of certiorari are granted.

17-419 DAWSON, JAMES, ET UX. V. STEAGER, WV STATE TAX COMM'R

The petition for a writ of certiorari is granted limited to the question presented by the Solicitor General in his brief for the United States as *amicus curiae*.

- 17-1094 NUTRACEUTICAL CORP. V. LAMBERT, TROY
- 17-1184 BIESTEK, MICHAEL J. V. BERRYHILL, NANCY A.
- 17-1229 HELSINN HEALTHCARE V. TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS

17-1272 HENRY SCHEIN, INC., ET AL. V. ARCHER AND WHITE SALES, INC.

The petitions for writs of certiorari are granted.

#### **CERTIORARI DENIED**

| 16-163 | ) | WYNN LAS | VEGAS, | LLC, | ET | AL. | ٧. | CESARZ, | JOSEPH, | ET AL. |
|--------|---|----------|--------|------|----|-----|----|---------|---------|--------|
|--------|---|----------|--------|------|----|-----|----|---------|---------|--------|

- 16-920 ) NAT. RESTAURANT ASSN., ET AL. V. DEPT. OF LABOR, ET AL.
- 17-528 STRANG, JENNIFER V. FORD MOTOR CO., ET AL.
- 17-1041 SHERIDAN, GERARD A. V. MELENDRES, MANUEL, ET AL.
- 17-1058 SNR WIRELESS LICENSECO, ET AL. V. FCC, ET AL.
- 17-1060 UNITED STATES, EX REL. CARTER V. HALLIBURTON CO., ET AL.
- 17-1093 REED, RODNEY V. TEXAS
- 17-1134 ) ELLISON, MARK A., ET AL. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-7809 ) SWENSON, DOUGLAS L. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-1150 HOU HSIAO, CHUNG V. HAZUDA, MARK, ET AL.
- 17-1153 SIERRA PACIFIC INDUS., ET AL. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-1172 DASSEY, BRENDAN V. DITTMANN, MICHAEL A.
- 17-1180 UNION PACIFIC RAILROAD CO. V. EEOC
- 17-1243 SPECIALITY FERTILIZER PRODUCTS V. SHELL OIL CO., ET AL.
- 17-1251 CASEY, CHARLES H. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-1279 BERNSTEIN SHUR, ET AL. V. SNOW, SUSAN R.
- 17-1300 ) FINDLAY, DAVID, ET AL. V. FEDERAL HOUSING FINANCE AGENCY
- 17-1302 ) NOMURA SEC. INT'L., INC., ET AL. V. FEDERAL HOUSING FINANCE AGENCY
- 17-1304 RODRIGUEZ VAZQUEZ, IVAN B. V. SESSIONS, ATT'Y GEN.
- 17-1309 UNIVERSAL PROCESSING SERV. OF WI V. FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
- 17-1314 RAZA, MOHSIN, ET AL. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-1328 PRESTON, ROBERT N., ET AL. V. ACOSTA, SEC. OF LABOR
- 17-1330 SHARP IMAGE GAMING, INC. V. SHINGLE SPRINGS BAND
- 17-1357 FIVE STAR SENIOR LIVING, ET AL. V. MANDVIWALA, MELINDA
- 17-1443 SECURITY PEOPLE, INC. V. OJMAR US, LLC

- 17-1457 MACDONALD, MICHELLE L. V. LAWYERS BOARD
- 17-1462 REDDI, SATYA V. V. HUGHES & HUGHES, ET AL.
- 17-1467 GEDDES, WILLIAM, ET AL. V. PEOPLES COUNSEL, ET AL.
- 17-1468 WILLISTON, KEITH V. VASTERLING, GAIL, ET AL.
- 17-1475 BEASON, RICHARD D. V. TEXAS
- 17-1482 WOODHULL, ANGELA V. V. MASCARELLA, SHIRLEY, ET AL.
- 17-1488 TIMBES, PAMELA M. V. DEUTSCHE BANK, ET AL.
- 17-1489 BRADDOCK, JAMES J. V. JOLIE, ANGELINA, ET AL.
- 17-1496 RINGGOLD, NINA, ET AL. V. SANKARY, MYER, ET AL.
- 17-1500 WILLIAMS, AMINATA M. V. 21ST MORTGAGE CORP., ET AL.
- 17-1525 SEGALINE, MICHAEL V. WA DEPT. OF LABOR, ET AL.
- 17-1526 DAVIDSON, JANA, ET AL. V. FAIRCHILD CONTROLS CORPORATION
- 17-1558 ODOM, ANTHONY C. V. ADGER, JERRY B., ET AL.
- 17-1567 JENSEN, WILLIAM F. V. OBENLAND, SUPT., MONROE
- 17-1577 BEST, LEONARD L., ET AL. V. CIR
- 17-1583 BALES, ROBERT V. UNDTED STATES
- 17-1585 BUGONI, PIERO A.V. O'BRIEN, TAYLOR, ET AL.
- 17-1593 SUBWAY RESTAURANTS, INC. V. WARCIAK, MATTHEW
- 17-1597 MULLARKEY, JOHN V. KAUFFMAN, SUPT., ET AL.
- 17-6790 WINGO, REBECCA V. KANSAS
- 17-7141 YOUNG, JAMES R. V. OCASIO, WARDEN
- 17-7282 HUEY, DARNELL L. V. KANSAS
- 17-7301 MEREDITH, STEVE V. KANSAS
- 17-7459 SCOTT, ROBERT V. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-7592 CHANEY, MICHAEL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-7785 STEVENS, RAYFORD V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8003 SIMMONS, AMI L. V. KANSAS
- 17-8188 GROUP, SCOTT V. ROBINSON, WARDEN

- 17-8344 THARPE, KEITH V. SELLERS, WARDEN
- 17-8428 REAVES, WILLIAM V. JONES, SEC., FL DOC
- 17-8572 SUGHRUE, FRANCIS W. V. FLORIDA, ET AL.
- 17-8574 JACOBS, JOHN J. V. ESTEFAN, EMILIO
- 17-8575 LINEHAN, DENNIS D. V. PIPER, EMILY
- 17-8577 BAILEY, ROBERT G. V. GARDNER, JOSEPH, ET AL.
- 17-8578 BAILEY, ROBERT G. V. BLAKE, C. C., ET AL.
- 17-8579 BRANNAN, DUANE F. V. KANSAS
- 17-8580 ADAMS, CHARLES R. V. BAILEY, LIEUTENANT, ET AL.
- 17-8581 BICKHAM, DEVIN V. ILLINOIS
- 17-8582 BAILEY, ROBERT G. V. CUMBERLAND COUNTY, NC, ET AL.
- 17-8589 RAFAY, ATIF V. WASHINGTON
- 17-8592 RODRIGUEZ, HUMBERTO V. DAVIS, DIR., TX DCJ
- 17-8593 BROOKS, KEITH C. V. RAEMISCH, EXEC. DIR., CO DOC
- 17-8596 DEKOM, MARTIN V. USDC DE
- 17-8597 STEVENSON, RONALD A.V. BISBEE, CONNIE S., ET AL.
- 17-8609 LOPEZ, JOSE M. V. SANTA ANA, CA, ET AL.
- 17-8610 LEPON, LEIGH L. V. IOWA
- 17-8613 THOMAS, HENRY A. V. FLORIDA
- 17-8620 K. H. V. WISCONSIN
- 17-8622 PAVON, MILTON V. TEXAS
- 17-8641 BOYD, MARINA J. V. CITIMORTGAGE INC.
- 17-8644 MARTIN, WILLIAM E. V. SINCLAIR COM. COLLEGE, ET AL.
- 17-8652 JONES, MARVIN B. V. FLORIDA
- 17-8656 BEACHEM, BRANDON R. V. FL DEPT. OF REVENUE
- 17-8657 BASSETT, WILLIE V. HORTON, WARDEN
- 17-8685 BELL, YOLANDA V. INOVA HEALTH CARE
- 17-8702 BRADLEY, ELOUISE V. WI DEPT. OF CHILDREN, ET AL.

- 17-8741 ZHUANG, LING V. SUPERIOR COURT OF CA, ET AL.
- 17-8742 MORALES, JONATHAN V. JONES, SEC., FL DOC
- 17-8758 KHALIL, EZZAT S. V. SESSIONS, ATT'Y GEN.
- 17-8825 WALKER, OCTAVIUS V. FLORIDA
- 17-8854 FISH, TERRY V. ELON PROPERTY MANAGEMENT
- 17-8868 MATTISON, LAWRENCE V. VIRGINIA
- 17-8907 JEANBART, LENSKY M. V. FLORIDA
- 17-8929 ISOM, LORNINOUS A. V. FLORIDA
- 17-8934 HAWKINS, GILLETTE V. KAUFFMAN, SUPT., HUNTINGDON
- 17-8941 KENNELL, JUANE T. V. GRIFFITH, WARDEN
- 17-8964 BURTON, DARRYL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8966 AVILA-LUNA, HECTOR M. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8969 NOE, PETER G. V. DANIELS, WARDEN
- 17-8975 BUXTON, ANDY V. ESTOCK, SUPT., MERCER, ET AL.
- 17-8978 JOSEPH, PATRICK V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8979 AMODEO, FRANK L. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8980 BLANCHARD, FRITZ V. UNITED STATES
- 17-8982 OWENS, SHONGO L. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9009 WILSON, MICHAEL S. V. GAETZ, DONALD, ET AL.
- 17-9029 SMITH, ANTOINE D. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9033 RILEY, SPENCER V. CALLOWAY, WARDEN
- 17-9037 GOFPHIN, DARYL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9039 PLAKETTA, ANTONIO P. V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9042 JACKSON, DONNELL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9043 FYKES, MICHAEL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9049 SUBLETT, RUSSELL V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9050 PATRICK SALVADOR V. UNITED STATES
- 17-9053 TIZOC, JOSE L. V. UNITED STATES

| 17-9055 | OLIVIER, RAYMOND E. V. UNITED STATES      |
|---------|---|
| 17-9057 | AGUDO-MONROY, BOGAR V. UNITED STATES      |
| 17-9059 | RIVERA-CRUZ, JOSE L. V. UNITED STATES     |
| 17-9061 | REYES-RAMIREZ, JAVIER V. UNITED STATES    |
| 17-9065 | CHAMBERS, CHRISTOPHER C. V. UNITED STATES |
| 17-9066 | FLOYD, JONATHAN V. UNITED STATES          |
| 17-9067 | DAVIS, MICHAEL R. V. UNITED STATES        |
| 17-9068 | BOAZ, THOMAS V. UNITED STATES             |
| 17-9070 | PINA, ORLANDO V. UNITED STATES            |
| 17-9083 | COOKE, JAMES E. V. DELAWARE               |

MAGEE, KAUNDA L. V. LOUISIANA

The petitions for writs of certiorari are denied.

17-423 STERBA, RICHARD, ET UX. V. PNC BANK

17-9129

The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied. Justice Alito took no part in the consideration or decision of this petition.

- 17-1159 ) NORTHERN ARAPAHO TRIBE, ET AL. V. WYOMING, ET AL.
- 17-1164 ) EASTERN SHOSHONE TRIBE V. WYOMING, ET AL.

The petitions for writs of certiorari are denied. Justice Gorsuch took no part in the consideration or decision of these petitions.

17-1354 GELHAUS, ERICK V. LOPEZ, ANDY

The motion of Peace Officers' Research Association of California, et al. for leave to file a brief as *amici curiae* is granted. The motion of California State Sheriffs' Association, et al. for leave to file a brief as *amici curiae* is granted. The motion of Force Litigation Consulting LLC, et al. for leave to file a brief as *amici curiae* is granted. The motion of

International Municipal Lawyers Association, et al. for leave to file a brief as *amici curiae* is granted. The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied.

17-1439 VEY, EILEEN V. TYSKIEWIEZ, JERRY

The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied. Justice Alito took no part in the consideration or decision of this petition.

17-7869 MARSHALL, MATTHEW V. JONES, SEC., FL DOC

The motion of The Promise of Justice Initiative for leave to file a brief as *amicus curiae* is granted. The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied.

17-8557 ROSE, SUSAN V. USCA 10

The motion of petitioner for leave to proceed *in forma*pauperis is denied, and the petition for a writ of certiorari is dismissed. See Rule 39.8.

17-8627 ARLOTTA, JAMES V. COOK MOVING SYSTEM, INC., ET AL.

The petition for a writ of certiorari before judgment is denied.

17-8643 KERSEY, GEORGE E. V. BECTON DICKINSON & CO., ET AL.

The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied. Justice Alito took no part in the consideration or decision of this petition.

- 17-8682 GILLESPIE, NEIL V. REVERSE MORTGAGE SOLUTIONS
- 17-8689 GILLESPIE, NEIL V. REVERSE MORTGAGE, ET AL.
- 17-9028 SCOTTON, ROGERIO C. V. UNITED STATES

The motions of petitioners for leave to proceed *in forma* pauperis are denied, and the petitions for writs of certiorari are dismissed. See Rule 39.8.

### HABEAS CORPUS DENIED

17-9155 IN RE LAWRENCE WILLIAMS

The petition for a writ of habeas corpus is denied.

#### MANDAMUS DENIED

17-8811 IN RE HAROLD B. MASON

The petition for a writ of mandamus is denied.

17-8965 IN RE ALLAH

The motion of petitioner for leave to proceed *in forma*pauperis is denied, and the petition for a writ of mandamus is dismissed. See Rule 39.8.

# **REHEARINGS DENIED**

17-6721 ONTIVEROS-CEDILLO, ADRIAN E. V. UNITED STATES

17-7918 IN RE JOHN V. COLEN

17-8167 SPALDING, DAVID L. V. UNITED STATES

17-8204 SAID, ALBER I V. CIR

The petitions for rehearing are denied.

# ATTORNEY DISCIPLINE

D-3013 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF STACY ENID LEBOW SIEGEL

Stacy Enid Lebow Siegel, of Towson, Maryland, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon her requiring her to show cause why she should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Stacy Enid Lebow Siegel is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3015 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF KEITH ALAN BASSI

Keith Alan Bassi, of Charleroi, Pennsylvania, having been

suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Keith Alan Bassi is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3016 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF HAROLD E. BRAZIL

Harold E. Brazil, of Washington, District of Columbia, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Harold E. Brazil is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3017 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF THOMAS ALLEN CRAWFORD, JR.

Thomas Allen Crawford, Jr., of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Thomas Allen Crawford, Jr. is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3018 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF JOHNNY S. GASKINS

Johnny S. Gaskins, of Raleigh, North Carolina, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Johnny S. Gaskins is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3019 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF LARRY JAMES LANDRY

Larry James Landry, of Seattle, Washington, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Larry James Landry is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3020 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF DIANA BETH DENRICH

Diana Beth Denrich, of Frederick, Maryland, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued requiring her to show cause why she should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Diana Beth Denrich is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3021 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF EDWARD SMITH, JR.

Edward Smith, Jr., of Baltimore, Maryland, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3023 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF KINSLEY FRAMPTON NYCE

Kinsley Frampton Nyce, of Columbus, Ohio, having been

suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 16, 2018; and a rule having been issued requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Kinsley Frampton Nyce is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3024 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF DONALD B. TERRELL

Donald B. Terrell, of Washington, District of Columbia, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Donald B. Terrell is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3025 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF WILLIAM LEE ANDREWS, III

William Lee Andrews, III, of Roanoke, Virginia, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that William Lee Andrews, III is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3026 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF SIDNEY MOXEY HARRELL, JR.

Sidney Moxey Harrell, Jr., of Mobile, Alabama, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Sidney Moxey Harrell, Jr. is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

D-3027 IN THE MATTER OF DISBARMENT OF BYRON CARROLL LOUDON

Byron Carroll Loudon, of Overland Park, Kansas, having been suspended from the practice of law in this Court by order of April 2, 2018; and a rule having been issued and served upon him requiring him to show cause why he should not be disbarred; and the time to file a response having expired;

It is ordered that Byron Carroll Loudon is disbarred from the practice of law in this Court.

III COURT.

RELITABLE VED FROM DE NOCRACY DOCKET. COM

RELITABLE VED FROM DE NOCRACY DOCKET.

Statement of SOTOMAYOR, J.

# SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

ROBERT IRA PEEDE v. JULIE L. JONES, SECRETARY, FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS, ET AL.

ON PETITION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE ELEVENTH CIRCUIT

No. 17-8491. Decided June 25, 2018

The petition for a writ of certiorari is denied.

Statement of JUSTICE SOTOMAYOR, with whom JUSTICE GINSBURG joins, respecting the denial of certiorari.

In his petition for writ of habeas corous under 28 U. S. C. §2254, petitioner Robert Peede contended that he received ineffective assistance of counsel during his capital sentencing proceedings because his trial counsel did not present certain mitigating evidence concerning his mental health and difficult childhood. The District Court granted habeas relief on the basis that counsel's performance was deficient and that there was a reasonable probability that Peede would have received a different sentence had counsel introduced the mitigating evidence. On appeal from that decision, the Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit reversed. In its view, Peede could not establish that he was prejudiced by any deficiency of counsel because the "new mitigation evidence . . . posed a doubled-edge-sword dilemma" in that "the new information could have hurt as much as it helped." Peede v. Attorney General, 715 Fed. Appx. 923, 931 (2017). The Eleventh Circuit further noted that it "ha[s] repeatedly ruled that [such so-called doubleedged post-conviction evidence is usually insufficient to warrant habeas relief." Id., at 931–932.

Such a blanket rule foreclosing a showing of prejudice because the new evidence is double edged flatly contradicts this Court's precedent. See *Rompilla* v. *Beard*, 545 U. S. 374, 393 (2005); *Wiggins* v. *Smith*, 539 U. S. 510, 534

#### Statement of SOTOMAYOR, J.

(2003); Williams v. Taylor, 529 U. S. 362, 398 (2000). As I recently emphasized in dissent from the denial of certiorari in Trevino v. Davis, 584 U. S. \_\_\_ (2018), "[w]here . . . new evidence presented during postconviction proceedings includes both mitigating and aggravating factors, a court still must consider all of the mitigating evidence alongside all of the aggravating evidence." Id., at \_\_\_ (slip op., at 3). That is, "new evidence must not be evaluated in isolation," regardless of whether it is considered to be double edged. Ibid.

Considering the posture of this case, under which our review is constrained by the Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996, 28 U. S. C. §§2254(d)(1)–(2), I cannot conclude the particular circumstances here warrant this Court's intervention. That said, the Eleventh Circuit's consideration of Peede's claim is deeply concerning. The ultimate question at issue in a case like this is whether "there is a reasonable probability that [the jury] would have struck a different balance." Wiggins, 539 U. S., at 537. A truncated consideration of new mitigating evidence that simply dismisses it as double edged does nothing to further that inquiry.