State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

April 20, 2023

CASES

2 No. 16
Courtney Anderson,
Respondent,
v.
Commack Fire District,
Appellant,
et al.,

Defendants.

3 No. 17
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Mark A. Hartle,
Appellant.

4 No. 28
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Thomas P. Perdue,
Appellant.

3 No. 25
The People &c.,
 Appellant,
 v.
Yermia Solomon, a/k/a Jeremy Solomon,
 Respondent.

Order reversed, with costs, that branch of defendants' motion seeking summary judgment dismissing the complaint insofar as asserted against defendant Commack Fire District granted and certified question answered in the negative.

Opinion by Judge Cannataro.

Judges Garcia, Singas and Troutman concur.

Judge Rivera dissents and votes to affirm in an opinion, in which Chief Judge Wilson concurs.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Garcia.
Judges Singas, Cannataro and Troutman concur.
Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Chief
Judge Wilson concurs.
Judge Halligan took no part.

Reargument ordered for a future Court session. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia, Singas, Cannataro and Troutman concur. Judge Halligan took no part.

Order affirmed, in a memorandum. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia, Singas, Cannataro and Troutman concur. Judge Halligan took no part.

MOTIONS

1 Mo. No. 2023-143 4069 Rosen Associates, LLC et al., Respondents, v. Tournamentone Corp., &c.,

Appellant.

Motion for sanctions denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2023-57
In the Matter of Harlan Brisard,
Appellant,
V.
Jasmine Brisard,
Respondent.

(And Another Proceeding.)

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Mo. No. 2023-223
In the Matter of Foreclosure of Tax Liens by the County of Broome.

County of Broome, Respondent; John Cadore et al., Appellants. On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion for a stay dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2023-249
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Marcus Brown,
Appellant.

Motion by Office of the Appellate Defender, et al. for leave to file a brief amici curiae on the appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. The brief must be submitted in digital format within seven days.

Judge Halligan took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2023-49 In the Matter of Jeremiah C., &c.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Kim C.,

Appellant; Catholic Guardian Services, Respondent.

2 SSD 18

In the Matter of Call-A-Head Portable Toilets, Inc., et al.,

Appellants,

v.

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-247

The People &c., Respondent, v.

Jairo Castillo,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2023-61

In the Matter of Justin R. Cutten, Appellant,

v.

Devan R. Harrington, Respondent.

4 Mo. No. 2023-238

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Carlos L. David,

Appellant.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Jenay Nurse Guilford, Esq., Center for Appellate Litigation, 120 Wall Street, 28th Floor, New York, NY 10005 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Julie A. Cianca, Esq., Monroe County Public Defender, 10 N. Fitzhugh Street, Rochester, NY 14614 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein. Judge Halligan took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2022-886
In the Matter of Jermaine Davis,
Appellant,
V.
Anthony I. Annucci. &c.

Anthony J. Annucci, &c., Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-210 The People &c., Respondent, v.

Dwane Estwick, Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2023-239
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
George Garcia,

Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2023-189
Lukasz Gottwald, &c., et al.,
Respondents,
v.
Kesha Rose Sebert, &c.,
Appellant,

et al.,
Defendants.

3 SSD 17
Aixa Graham,
Appellant,
v.
State of New York,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Patricia Pazner, Esq., Appellate Advocates, 111 John Street, 9th Floor, New York, NY 10038 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion, pursuant to CPL 460.60 (3), to extend the time for argument or submission of the appeal and to continue the stay granted and stay continued pending determination of the appeal.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion by The Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press, et al. for leave to file a brief amici curiae on the appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. The brief must be submitted in digital format within seven days. Judge Halligan took no part.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Halligan took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2023-127
In the Matter of Corey J. Hogan, &c.,
Appellant.

Grievance Committee of the Eighth Judicial District,

Respondent.

SSD 15

The People &c. ex rel. Phillip Holloway, Appellant,

v.

Superintendent James Johnson, &c., Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2023-290

IKB International, S.A., &c., et al., Respondents,

v.

Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., &c., et al., Appellants,

ABFC 2006-OPT1 Trust, et al., Nominal Defendants. (And Three Other Actions.)

Mo. No. 2022-893

Thomas Lent,

Appellant,

v.

City of New York, et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for a stay dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

Appeal transferred without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, to the Appellate Division, Second Department, upon the ground that a direct appeal does not lie where questions other than the constitutional validity of a statutory provision are involved (*see* NY Const art VI §§ 3 [b] [2], [5] [b]; CPLR 5601 [b] [2]).

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion by American Bankers Association for leave to file a brief amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed as untimely (*see* CPLR 5513 [b]). Judge Halligan took no part.

Mo. No. 2023-156
In the Matter of Michael McRae, &c.,
Respondent;
Vivian Hill,
Appellant.

1 SSD 19

Paul Nichols et al.,

Appellants,

et al.,

Petitioner,

V

Kathy Hochul, &c., et al., Respondents.

3 Mo. No. 2023-71

In the Matter of Michael NN., Appellant,

v.

Robert OO.,

Respondent.

3 Mo. No. 2023-63 In the Matter of Zaiden P. et al., &c.

Cortland County Department of Social Services.

Respondent;

Bayshawn P.,

Appellant.

(And Related Proceedings.)

On the Court's own motion, appeal transferred, without costs, to the Appellate Division, First Department, upon the ground that a direct appeal does not lie when questions other than the constitutional validity of a statutory provision are involved (*see* NY Const, art VI, §§ 3 [b] [2], 5 [b]; CPLR 5601 [b] [2]).

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that this Court does not have jurisdiction to entertain it (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3; CPLR 5602). Judge Halligan took no part.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part. 3 Mo. No. 2023-105 In the Matter of Zaiden P. et al., &c.

Cortland County Department of Social Services,

Respondent;

Ashley Q.,

Appellant.

(And Related Proceedings.)

2 Mo. No. 2023-261

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Tyrone Peters,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2023-73 In the Matter of Mia S.

Suffolk County Department of Social Services,

Respondent;

Michelle C.,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2023-222

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Jeremy B. Soto,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and Eric Nelson, Esq., 54 Florence Street, Staten Island, NY 10308 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for an extension of the time within which to apply for permission to appeal pursuant to CPL 460.20 granted and motion papers treated as a timely CPL 460.20 application.

Judge Halligan took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2022-898 In the Matter of Briana S.-S.

Genesee County Department of Social Services,

Respondent;

Ricardo S.,

Appellant.

(And Related Proceedings.)

4 Mo. No. 2023-7 In the Matter of Briana S.-S.

Respondents.

SSD 16

State of New York, Respondent,

v.

Carlotta R. Summers, Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2023-252
In the Matter of St. Lawrence County et al.,
Appellants,
V.
City of Ogdensburg et al.,
Respondents,
al.,
Resr Motion by New York State Association of Counties for leave to appear amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven

Judge Halligan took no part.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court sua sponte, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution. Judge Halligan took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2023-274
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Kevin L. Thomas,
Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2023-42 Shaindy Weichman, Appellant, v. Yecheskel C. Weichman, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-66 Shaindy Weichman, Appellant, v. Yecheskel C. Weichman, Respondent.

4 Mo. No. 2023-236
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Talarico Young,
Appellant.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and John B. Casey, Esq., c/o Casey Law LLC, 4 Tower Place, Suite 100, Albany, NY 12203 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion by A.G., et al. for leave to appear amici curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for an extension of the time within which to apply for permission to appeal pursuant to CPL 460.20 granted and motion papers treated as a timely CPL 460.20 application.

Judges Troutman and Halligan took no part.