

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF RICHMOND

----- X

VITO J. FOSSELLA, NICHOLAS A. LANGWORTHY,
JOSEPH BORRELLI, NICOLE MALLIOTAKIS,
ANDREW LANZA, MICHAEL REILLY, MICHAEL
TANNOUSIS, INNA VERNIKOV, DAVID CARR,
JOANN ARIOLA, VICKIE PALADINO, ROBERT
HOLDEN, GERARD KASSAR, VERALIA
MILLIOTAKIS, MICHAEL PETROV, WAFIK HABIB,
PHILLIP YAN HING WONG, NEW YORK
REPUBLICAN STATE COMMITTEE, and
REPUBLICAN NATIONAL COMMITTEE,

**DEFENDANTS ERIC ADAMS
AND NEW YORK CITY
COUNCIL’S RESPONSE TO
PLAINTIFFS’ STATEMENT
OF UNDISPUTED
MATERIAL FACTS AND
ADDITIONAL STATEMENT
OF UNDISPUTED
MATERIAL FACTS**

Index No. 85007/2022

Plaintiffs,

-against-

ERIC ADAMS, in his official capacity as Mayor of New
York City, BOARD OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF
NEW YORK, CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NEW
YORK, HINA NAVEED, ABRAHAM PAULOS,
CARLOS VARGAS GALINDO, EMILI PRADO, EVA
SANTOS VELOZ, MELISSA JOHN, ANGEL SALAZAR,
MUHAMMAD SHAHIDUALLAH, and JAN EZRA
UNDAG,

Defendants.

----- X

City Defendants’ Response To Plaintiffs’ Statement Of Material Facts

The Non-Citizen Voting Law

1. On December 9, 2021, the New York City Council, the legislative body
for the City of New York, passed a bill, referred to as Intro 1867-A and entitled “A Local Law to
amend the New York city charter, in relation to allowing lawful permanent residents and persons
authorized to work in the United States in New York city to participate in municipal elections.”

See <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4313327&GUID=DF600BDA-B675-41D8-A8BD-282C38DC4C62&Options=ID%7cText%7c&Search=1867>.

Response: Admitted.

2. The bill was sent to then-Mayor Bill de Blasio the same day. See <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4313327&GUID=DF600BDA-B675-41D8-A8BD-282C38DC4C62&Options=ID%7cText%7c&Search=1867>.

Response: Admitted.

3. Mayor de Blasio publicly questioned the legality of the bill, stating that the City's "Law Department is very clear on this. It's (not) legal for this to be decided at the city level. I really believe this has to be decided at the state level." Alexandra Hutzler, New York City Bill to Allow Noncitizens to Vote Has Support From Incoming Mayor Eric Adams, Newsweek Nov. 23, 2021, <https://bit.ly/3KU9zv3> (alteration in original). Despite "big legal questions" about its validity, Mayor de Blasio declined to veto the bill out of "respect [for] the City Council." Natalie Colarassi, De Blasio Has 'Mixed Feelings' Over Allowing 800k Non-Citizens to Vote in NYC Elections, Newsweek, (Dec. 12, 2021), <https://bit.ly/3KHswB1>.

Response: Disputed. Statements from newspaper articles by former Mayor de Blasio are inadmissible hearsay and may not be used to prove the truth of the matter asserted, and, to the extent the statement references discussions with the City's attorneys, the City does not waive attorney-client privilege. See, e.g., Platovsky v. City of N.Y., 275 A.D.2d 699, 700 (2d Dep't 2000) (citing Young v. Fleary, 226 A.D.2d 454, 455 (2d Dep't 1996)). Admitted insofar as Mayor de Blasio did not veto Intro 1867-A.

4. Mayor de Blasio neither signed nor vetoed the bill before leaving office at the end of the year. See <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4313327&GUID=DF600BDA-B675-41D8-A8BD-282C38DC4C62&Options=ID%7cText%7c&Search=1867>.

Response: Admitted.

5. Bill de Blasio was replaced as Mayor by Eric Adams on January 1, 2022.

See <https://www1.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/000-22/eric-1-adams-sworn-as-110th-mayor-new-york-city>.

Response: Admitted.

6. The incoming Mayor Adams returned the bill unsigned on January 10, 2022.

See <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4313327&GUID=DF600BDA-B675-41D8-A8BD-282C38DC4C62&Options=ID%7cText%7c&Search=1867>

Response: Admitted.

7. As the bill was neither approved nor returned with objections within thirty days, it was deemed adopted pursuant to § 37(b) of the New York City Charter as Local Law No. 11 of 2022 and is codified in the City Charter as the new Chapter 46-A. See Hawrylchak Aff., Exs. A, B.

Response: Partially Disputed. Admitted insofar as the bill was neither signed nor returned with objections by the Mayor and was deemed adopted pursuant to § 37(b) of the New York City Charter as Local Law No. 11 of 2022 and Local Law 11 § 1 is codified in the City Charter as Chapter 46-a. Disputed insofar as Local Law 11 §§ 2 & 3 appear in New York City Administrative Code (“Admin. Code”) Appendix (“App.”) A, L.L. 2022/011.

8. This law creates a new class of persons called “municipal voters,” defined as non-citizens who are either lawful permanent residents or persons authorized to work in the United States, “who meet[] all qualifications for registering or pre-registering to vote under the

election law, except for possessing United States citizenship.” N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-aa(a); Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. B.

Response: Admitted insofar as Local Law 11 allows qualified lawful permanent residents or individuals authorized to work in the United States, “who meet[] all qualifications for registering or pre-registering to vote under the election law, except for possessing United States citizenship” to vote in City elections to fill City offices.

9. Under the law, “eligible municipal voters shall have the right to vote in municipal elections and shall be entitled to the same rights and privileges as U.S. citizen voters with regard to municipal elections.” N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-bb(a); Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. B.

Response: Admitted insofar as paragraph 9 contains an accurate partial quotation from Charter § 1057-bb.

10. The New York City Board of Elections is tasked with “adopt[ing] all necessary rules and carry[ing] out all necessary staff training to carry out the provisions of this chapter.” N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-cc; Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. B.

Response: Admitted insofar as the Board of Elections in the City of New York (“City BOE”) is tasked with, inter alia, “adopt[ing] all necessary rules and carry[ing] out all necessary staff training to carry out the provisions of [Charter Chapter 46-a].”

11. These provisions include creating a parallel non-citizen voter registration form, § 1057-ee(a); maintaining a unified voter registration list that distinguishes between citizen and non-citizen voters, N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-dd(a); creating parallel non-citizen ballots and absentee ballots, N.Y.C. Charter §§ 1057-dd(b), 1057-hh(d); and allowing citizens and non-citizens to vote at the same polling places, N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-dd(a). Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. B.

Response: Admitted insofar as paragraph 11 contains a partial and non-inclusive summary of Charter §§ 1057-dd(a) & hh(d).

12. In addition to voting in elections, the Non-Citizen Voting Law allows registered non-citizen voters to enroll in political parties, N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-ff; and to sign and witness petitions for municipal offices and referenda, N.Y.C. Charter § 1057-uu. Hawrylchak Aff., Ex.

Response: Admitted insofar as paragraph 12 contains a partial and non-inclusive summary of Charter §§ 1057-ff & uu.

The Lawsuit

13. On January 10, 2022, Plaintiffs filed their Complaint in this action, alleging that the Non-Citizen Voting Law is invalid under both the New York State Constitution and under statutory provisions of the Election Law and the Municipal Home Rule Law, and seeking declaratory and injunctive relief. Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. E.

Response: Admitted insofar as paragraph 13 describes the allegations in the Complaint, which was filed on or about January 10, 2022.

14. On February 25, 2022, Defendants Eric Adams and the City Council of the City of New York filed their Answer. Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. F.

Response: Admitted.

15. On April 11, 2022, Defendant Board of Elections in the City of New York filed its Answer. Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. G.

Response: Admitted.

16. Also on April 11, 2022, several individual non-citizen residents of New York City filed a motion to intervene as defendants with a proposed answer. NYSCEF No. 36; Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. H.

Response: Admitted.

17. On April 13, 2022, the Court granted the motion to intervene, which was unopposed. NYSCEF No. 51.

Response: Admitted

The Plaintiffs

18. Plaintiff Vito J. Fossella is the current Staten Island Borough President. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Richmond County, and a registered voter in Richmond County and the City of New York. Fossella Aff. ¶¶ 3, 5.

Response: Admitted

19. Plaintiff Nicholas A. Langworthy is the current Chairman of the New York Republican State Committee. He is directly involved in the party's election-related efforts, including with respect to New York City municipal elections. Langworthy Aff. ¶¶ 2, 7.

Response: Admitted

20. Plaintiff Joseph Borelli is a current Member of the New York City Council from Staten Island representing the 51st District and is currently serving as the Minority Leader. As a Member of the City Council, he voted against the Non-Citizen Voting Law. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Richmond County, and a registered voter in Richmond County and the City of New York. Borelli Aff. ¶¶ 3, 5.

Response: Admitted

21. Plaintiff Michael Reilly is a State Assemblymember representing the 62nd District, which includes part of Staten Island. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Richmond County, and a registered voter in Richmond County and the City of New York. Reilly Aff. ¶¶ 3, 4.

Response: Admitted

22. Plaintiff Michael Tannousis is a State Assemblymember representing the 64th District, which includes parts of Staten Island and Brooklyn. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Richmond County, and a registered voter in Richmond County and the City of New York. Tannousis Aff. ¶¶ 3, 4.

Response: Admitted

23. Plaintiff Robert Holden is a current Member of the New York City Council from Queens representing the 30th District. As a Member of the City Council, he voted against the Non-Citizen Voting Law. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Queens County, a registered voter in Queens County and the City of New York, and an enrolled Democrat. Holden Aff. ¶¶ 3, 5.

Response: Admitted

24. Plaintiff Gerard Kassar is the current Chairman of the Conservative Party of New York State, a New York State political committee, as defined by New York State Election Law § 2-102. He is directly involved in the party's election-related efforts, including with respect to New York City municipal elections. He is a citizen of the United States, a resident of Kings County, and a registered voter in Kings County and the City of New York. Kassar Aff. ¶¶ 3, 4, 6, 11.

Response: Admitted

25. Plaintiff Phillip Yan Hing Wong is a naturalized citizen of the United States, a resident of Queens County, and a registered voter in Queens County and the City of New York. Wong Aff. ¶ 3.

Response: Admitted

26. Plaintiff New York Republican State Committee is a New York State political committee, as defined by New York State Election Law § 2-102. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 4.

27. Plaintiff Republican National Committee is the national committee of the Republican Party, as defined by 52 U.S.C. § 30101(14). Echols Aff. ¶ 3

Response: Admitted

Impact on Voters

28. Plaintiffs Vito J. Fossella, Joseph Borelli, Michael Reilly, Michael Tannousis, Robert Holden, Gerard Kassar, and Phillip Yan Hing Wong have regularly voted in New York City municipal elections and intend to continue doing so in the future. Fossella Aff. ¶ 6; Borelli Aff. ¶ 6; Reilly Aff. ¶ 5; Tannousis Aff. ¶ 5; Holden Aff. ¶ 6; Kassar Aff. ¶ 12; Wong Aff. ¶ 4.

Response: Admitted

29. According to statements in the legislative record by proponents of the Non-Citizen Voting Law, it would allow “900,000 New Yorkers with legal status the ability to vote.” Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. G, at 2.

Response: Admitted insofar as it is estimated an additional 800,000-1,000,000 individuals could become eligible to vote in municipal elections under L.L. 11.

30. The Executive Director of the Board of Elections estimated that the law could result in as much as “a 20 percent increase in the number of voters.” Hawrylchak Aff., Ex. H, at 67–69.

Response: Admitted.

31. By dramatically increasing the pool of eligible voters, the Non-Citizen Voting Law will dilute the votes of citizens in future municipal elections. Fossella Aff. ¶ 7; Borelli Aff. ¶ 7; Reilly Aff. ¶ 6; Tannousis Aff. ¶ 6; Holden Aff. ¶ 7; Kassar Aff. ¶ 13; Wong Aff. ¶ 5.

Response: Disputed. There is no evidence of record, other than plaintiffs’ self-serving and conclusory allegation, that L.L. 11 will “dilute” the votes of pre-existing voters in municipal elections, nor do plaintiffs define what is meant by “dilute.”

Impact on Candidates

32. The Non-Citizen Voting Law, which purports to allow certain non-citizens to vote in New York City municipal elections, would dramatically change the electoral composition of the City of New York and its electoral subdivisions. This will require current officeholders, including Plaintiffs Vito J. Fossella, Joseph Borelli, and Robert Holden, to change the way they campaign for reelection and may materially affect their likelihood of electoral victory. Fossella Aff. ¶ 4. Borelli Aff. ¶ 4; Holden Aff. ¶ 4.

Response: Disputed. There is no evidence of record, other than plaintiffs’ self-serving, speculative, and conclusory allegations, to support the assertion in paragraph 32.

Impact on Parties

33. The New York Republican State Committee and the Conservative Party of New York State manage their respective parties’ business at the state level, including supporting

candidates for public office at all levels in New York State elections, coordinating fundraising and election strategy, and developing and promoting their respective state platforms. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 5; Kassar Aff. ¶ 6.

Response: Admitted.

34. The New York Republican State Committee and the Conservative Party of New York State engage in various activities to help elect Republicans and Conservatives in New York, including to municipal office in New York City. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 6; Kassar Aff. ¶ 5.

Response: Admitted.

35. The Republican National Committee manages the Republican Party's business at the national level, supports Republican candidates for public office at all levels, coordinates fundraising and election strategy, and develops and promotes the national Republican platform. Echols Aff. ¶ 4.

Response: Admitted.

36. The Republican National Committee engages in various activities to help elect Republicans in New York, including to municipal office in New York City. One of these activities is providing support to the New York Republican State Committee in its efforts to elect Republicans up and down the ballot in New York. Echols Aff. ¶ 5.

Response: Admitted.

37. The Non-Citizen Voting Law, which purports to allow certain non-citizens to vote in New York City municipal elections, would dramatically change the electoral composition of New York City for municipal elections. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 8; Kassar Aff. ¶ 7; Echols Aff. ¶ 6.

Response: Disputed. There is no evidence of record, other than plaintiffs' self-serving, speculative, and conclusory allegation, that L.L. 11 will "dramatically change the electoral composition of New York City."

38. The Non-Citizen Voting Law will require the New York Republican State Committee, the Conservative Party of New York State, and the Republican National Committee to make changes to virtually all of their activities with respect to New York City municipal elections, including fundraising, election strategy, candidate development and selection, the content and targeting of election advertising, and voter turnout efforts. These changes would likely include, for example, creating more non-English-language advertising to target non-citizen communities and recruiting volunteers from non-citizen communities for canvassing and voter turnout efforts. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 9; Kassar Aff. ¶ 8; Echols Aff. ¶ 7.

Response: Disputed. There is no evidence of record, other than plaintiffs' self-serving, speculative, and conclusory allegation, that L.L. 11 will "require... [Plaintiffs] to make changes to virtually all of their activities with respect to New York City municipal elections."

39. The Non-Citizen Voting Law's expansion of the electorate to include non-citizens necessarily increases the burden on the New York Republican State Committee, the Conservative Party of New York State, and the Republican National Committee in supporting their candidates participating in New York City municipal elections by forcing them to appropriate additional resources due to the expanded voter pool. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 10; Kassar ¶ 9; Echols Aff. ¶ 8.

Response: Disputed. There is no evidence of record, other than plaintiffs' self-serving, speculative, and conclusory allegation, that L.L. 11 will "increases the burden" on Plaintiffs in any way.

40. The Non-Citizen Voting Law may materially affect the likelihood of electoral victory by Republican and Conservative candidates in New York City municipal elections. Langworthy Aff. ¶ 11; Kassir Aff. ¶ 10; Echols Aff. ¶ 9.

Response: Disputed insofar as speculation about what “may” occur as a result of L.L. 11 is not an “undisputed material fact.”

CITY DEFENDANTS’ ADDITIONAL UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS

Local Law 11 of 2022¹

41. Local Law 11 of 2022 was introduced in the City Council as Introduction (“Int.”) 1867 of 2020 on January 23, 2020 and referred to the Committee on Governmental Operations. See Affirmation of Aimee K. Lulich (“Lulich Aff.”), Ex. A; Legislative Record.

42. The Committee on Governmental Operations held a hearing regarding Int. 1867 on September 20, 2021 at which testimony was heard. See Lulich Aff., Ex. E.

43. Another hearing on Int. 1867 was held by the Committee on Governmental Operations on December 8, 2021. Int. 1867 was amended on December 8, 2021, and the Committee voted to approve Int. 1867 the same day. See Lulich Aff., Ex. G & H.

44. City Council voted to approve Int. 1867 on December 9, 2021, and sent Int. 1867 to the Mayor for signature. See Lulich Aff., Ex. J & L.

45. The Mayor took no action regarding Int. 1867, which was assigned the name Local Law 11 of 2022 and became law on January 9, 2022. See Legislative Record.

46. As enacted, Local Law 11 consists of three Sections. Section 1 added Chapter 46-A to the New York City Charter (“Charter”). Section 2 provided that the New York City Board of Elections (“City BOE”) submit to the Mayor and City Council a plan for

¹ The full legislative record for Local Law 11 of 2022 (Int. 1867) is also publicly available at: <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4313327&GUID=DF600BDA-B675-41D8-A8BD-282C38DC4C62> (last visited May 9, 2022).

implementation of Charter Chapter 46-A by July 1, 2022. Section 3 provided the dates by which Sections 1 and 2 are in effect. See Lulich Aff., Ex M.²

Text of Local Law 11 of 2022

47. Local Law 11 § 1 amended the New York City Charter to add Chapter 46-A, entitled “Voting by Lawful Permanent Residents and Persons Authorized to Work in the United States,” consisting of Sections 1057-aa through 1057-vv. Id.

48. In summary, Local Law 11 allows qualified lawful permanent residents or individuals authorized to work in the United States (referred to as “Municipal Voters”) to vote in City elections to fill City offices. Charter § 1057-bb directs:

a. Consistent with the provisions of this chapter, eligible municipal voters shall have the right to vote in municipal elections and shall be entitled to the same rights and privileges as U.S. citizen voters with regard to municipal elections. All registered municipal voters shall have their names entered in the registration records maintained by the board of elections in the city of New York under article 5 of the election law for the purposes of registering and voting in municipal elections and may thereafter vote in any such election. Registrations for municipal voters entered in such records shall not contain United States citizenship data as required under 5-500 of the election law and shall be designated with an “M”. Municipal voter registration records shall be filed with the state board of elections with such designation, to be included in any appropriate list or database in accordance with law.

b. Section 5-102 of the election law shall apply to municipal elections, except that the qualification of United States citizenship shall not apply to municipal voters registering to vote in municipal elections and the municipal voting processes implemented pursuant to this chapter.

c. References to voter qualification or voter eligibility in the election law shall be construed to include municipal voter qualifications with respect to the municipal voting processes implemented pursuant to this chapter.

² Local Law 11 § 1 is published in Chapter 46-A of the Charter. Sections 2 and 3 are also available in Appendix (“App.”) A of the New York City Administrative Code (“Admin. Code”), L.L. 2022/011.

(emphasis added)

49. An individual who is not a United States citizen is a “Municipal Voter”

under Local Law 11 if such individual:

is either a lawful permanent resident or authorized to work in the United States, who is a resident of New York city and will have been such a resident for 30 consecutive days or longer by the date of such election, who meets all qualifications for registering or pre-registering to vote under the election law, except for possessing United States citizenship, and who has registered or pre-registered to vote with the board of elections in the city of New York under this chapter.

Charter § 1057-aa(a).

50. A Municipal Voter may vote in Municipal Elections, defined as “any general, primary, or run-off election for a municipal office, any special election for a municipal office... and any municipal referendum.” Id.

51. “Municipal Offices” are the “offices of mayor, public advocate, comptroller, borough president, and council member.” Id.

52. A “Municipal Referendum” is “an election for the approval of a local law, as defined in section 2 of the municipal home rule law, submitted to the voters of the city of New York.” Id.

53. The processes required under Charter Chapter 46-A that facilitate municipal voter registration and voting by municipal voters in municipal elections are referred to as “Municipal Voting.” Id.

54. Local Law 11 directs that Municipal Voting... “shall be governed by applicable provisions of the election law, except that the provisions of the election law set forth in this chapter... shall apply as modified herein... Provisions of the election law not specified in this chapter shall apply to municipal voting, provided however that such provisions shall not be construed to prevent or impede the application of this chapter.” Charter § 1057-aa(b).

55. Local Law 11 does not permit Municipal Voters to “vote for any state or federal office or political party position or on any state or federal ballot question.” Charter § 1057-rr.

56. The Board of Elections in the City of New York (“City BOE”) is directed to carry out the provisions of Local Law 11. See Charter § 1057-cc.

57. Local Law 11 sets forth provisions for poll administration, voter registration, enrollment, absentee voting, election-related notifications, and challenges to voter qualifications for Municipal Voters. See Charter §§ 1057-dd – qq.

58. The law further provides that, upon request by a Municipal Voter, the City BOE issue a registration confirmation letter containing the dates during which such voter was registered and an explanation of the rights and privileges afforded to municipal voters in the City. See Charter § 1057-vv.

59. Provisions regarding violations of the law are set forth in Charter § 1057-ss as follows:

a. Any person who knowingly and willfully violates any provision of this section of the charter which violation is not specifically covered by section 17-168 or any other provision of article seventeen of the election law is guilty of a misdemeanor.

b. A public officer or employee who knowingly and willfully omits, refuses or neglects to perform any act required of such public officer or employee by this chapter, who knowingly and willfully refuses to permit the doing of any act authorized by this chapter, or who knowingly and willfully hinders, or delays or attempts to hinder or delay the performance of such an act is, if not otherwise subject to section 17-128 of the election law or any other law, guilty of a misdemeanor.

c. Any person convicted of a misdemeanor under this section shall be punished by imprisonment for not more than one year, or by a fine of not less than one hundred dollars nor more than five hundred dollars, or by both such fine and imprisonment.

60. Section 1057-tt provides for an advisory group to make recommendations regarding Municipal Voting, and sets forth the membership terms and responsibilities. See Charter § 1057-tt.

61. Local Law § 2 directs:

No later than July 1, 2022, the board of elections in the city of New York shall submit to the mayor and speaker of the council a report containing a plan for achieving timely implementation of this local law for applicable elections held on or after January 9, 2023. Failure by such board to submit such a report within 30 days of July 1, 2022 shall create a rebuttable presumption that such board is declining to implement this local law.

See Local Law 11 § 2, Admin. Code App. A, L.L. 2022/011.

62. Local Law 11 § 3 provides that Chapter 46-A of the Charter “takes effect on December 9, 2022 and shall apply to municipal elections held on or after January 9, 2023, provided that before such date, the board of elections in the city of New York and any other governmental agency may take such actions as are necessary or appropriate to implement this local law.” See Local Law 11 § 3, New York City Administrative Code (“Admin. Code”) Appendix (“App.”) A, L.L. 2022/011.

Dated: New York, New York
May 27, 2022

HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX

Corporation Counsel of the
City of New York
Attorney for Defendants Mayor Eric Adams and New
York City Council

By: Aimee E. Lulich
Aimee Lulich
Assistant Corporation Counsel
100 Church Street
New York, New York 10007
(212) 356-2369

Index No. 85007/2022

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF RICHMOND

VITO J. FOSSELLA, NICHOLAS A.
LANGWORTHY, JOSEPH BORRELLI, NICOLE
MALLIOTAKIS, ANDREW LANZA, MICHAEL
REILLY, MICHAEL TANNOUSIS, INNA
VERNIKOV, DAVID CARR, JOANN ARIOLA,
VICKIE PALADINO, ROBERT HOLDEN, GERARD
KASSAR, VERALIA MILLIOTAKIS, MICHAEL
PETROV, WAFIK HABIB, PHILLIP YAN HING
WONG, NEW YORK REPUBLICAN STATE
COMMITTEE, and REPUBLICAN NATIONAL
COMMITTEE,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

ERIC ADAMS, in his official capacity as Mayor of
New York City, BOARD OF ELECTIONS IN THE
CITY OF NEW YORK, CITY COUNCIL OF THE
CITY OF NEW YORK, HINA NAVEED, ABRAHAM
PAULOS, CARLOS VARGAS GALINDO, EMILI
PRADO, EVA SANTOS VELOZ, MELISSA JOHN,
ANGEL SALAZAR, MUHAMMAD
SHAHIDUALLAH, and JAN EZRA UNDA,

Defendants.

**DEFENDANTS ERIC ADAMS AND NEW YORK
CITY COUNCIL'S RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS'
STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED MATERIAL
FACTS AND ADDITIONAL STATEMENT OF
UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS**