UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

PUBLIC INTEREST LEGAL FOUNDATION,

Plaintiff,

ν.

JOCELYN BENSON, in her official capacity as Michigan Secretary of State,

Civ. No. 1:21-cv-929

Defendant.

JOINT STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS

- 1. The Foundation is a non-profit, public interest organization that seeks to promote the integrity of elections nationwide through research, education, remedial programs, and litigation. (ECF No. 1 PageID.2.)
- 2. Defendant is Michigan Secretary of State, Jocelyn Benson, who is the chief election officer of Michigan. Mich. Comp. Laws § 168.21; Mich. Comp. Laws § 168.509n. (ECF No. 1 PageID.2.)
- 3. On September 18, 2020, the Foundation sent, via email and mail, a letter to Defendant. (ECF No. 1 PageID.9, ECF 1-4, PageID.48-50.)
- 4. On or about September 24, 2020, Defendant received the Foundation's mailed letter dated September 18, 2020. (ECF No. 14, PageID.146.)
- 5. Defendant sent a letter to the Foundation on September 29, 2020. (ECF No. 1 PageID.9.)
- 6. The Foundation sent a letter to the Defendant on October 5, 2020. (ECF No. 1 PageID.9, ECF No. 1-6, PageID.52-53.)

- 7. Defendant received the Foundation's October 5, 2020, letter. (ECF No. 14, PageID.147.) Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 145:7-13.
- 8. Melissa Malerman, former Bureau of Elections Director of Filing Disclosure and Compliance Division, sent an email to Jonathan Brater on October 5, 2020. (MDOS Dep, p 96 ln 6-19; MDOS Dep, Exhibit 4 E-mail 10/5/2020.)
- 9. On November 25, 2020, the Foundation sent a letter to the Defendant. (ECF No. 1 PageID.11, ECF No. 1-8, PageID.61-62.)
- 10. Defendant received the Foundation's November 25, 2020, letter. (ECF No. 14, PageID.149.) Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 147:8-15.
- 11. On December 11, 2020, the Foundation sent a letter to the Defendant. (ECF No. 1 PageID.11, ECF No. 1-9, PageID.63-64)
- 12. Defendant received Foundation's letter dated December 11, 2020. Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 149:19-150-1.
- 13. On December 17, 2020, the Foundation received an email from Defendant's office (ECF No. 1 PageID.12, ECF No. 1-10, PageID.65-66.) Deposition of the Michigan Department of State at 118:12-15.
- 14. On December 18, 2020, the Foundation sent a letter to the Defendant. (ECF No. 1 PageID.12; ECF No. 1-11, PageID.67-68)
- 15. Defendant received the Foundation's letter dated December 18, 2020. (ECF No. 14, PageID.151.)
- 16. Defendant did not respond to the Foundation's letter dated December 18, 2020.(ECF No. 14, PageID.151.)

- 17. Ninety days following the Foundation's December 18, 2020, Letter was March 18, 2021.
- 18. On January 13, 2021, the Foundation wrote another letter to the Defendant. (ECF No. 1 PageID.12, ECF No 1-13, PageID.72-73.)
- 19. Defendant received the January 13, 2021, correspondence and accompanying data. (ECF No. 14, PageID.151.) Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 151:17-24.
- 20. Defendant did not respond to the January 13, 2021, correspondence and accompanying data. (ECF No. 14, PageID.151; ECF No. 1-13, PageID.72-73.)
- 21. Defendant maintains a database for voter registration. The database is called the Qualified Voter File ("QVF"). Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 31:20-24.
- 22. Defendant maintains a statewide database for driver file records. This database is known as CARS. Deposition of Jonathan Brater at 32:4-11.

Dated: October 2, 2023

For the Plaintiff:

/s/ Kaylan Phillips
Kaylan Phillips
Noel Johnson
Joseph M. Nixon
J. Christian Adams
Public Interest Legal Foundation
32 E. Washington Street, Ste. 1675
Indianapolis, IN 46204
Telephone: (317) 203-5599
kphillips@publicinterestlegal.org
njohnson@publicinterestlegal.org
jnixon@publicinterestlegal.org
adams@publicinterestlegal.org

Dated: October 2, 2023

For the Defendant:

/s/ Erik A. Grill (with permission)

Erik A. Grill (P64713)
Heather S. Meingast (P55439)
Assistant Attorneys General
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, Michigan 48909
517.335.7659
grille@michigan.gov
meingasth@michigan.gov