

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF OHIO**

**Bria Bennett, et al.,**

**Petitioners,**

**v.**

**Ohio Redistricting Commission, et al.,**

**Respondents.**

**Case No. 2021-1198**

Original Action Filed Pursuant to Ohio  
Constitution, Article XI, Section 9(A)

*[Apportionment Case Pursuant to S.  
Ct. Prac. R. 14.03]*

---

**PETITIONERS' MOTION TO ENFORCE THE COURT'S MAY 25, 2022 ORDER AND  
REQUIRE RESPONDENTS TO EXPLAIN THEIR FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH  
SUCH ORDER**

---

Abha Khanna (PHV 2189-2021)  
Ben Stafford (PHV 25433-2021)  
ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP  
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100  
Seattle, WA 98101  
T: (206) 656-0176  
F: (206) 656-0180  
akhanna@elias.law  
bstafford@elias.law

Jyoti Jasrasaria (PHV 25401-2021)  
Spencer W. Klein (PHV 25432-2021)  
Harleen K. Gambhir (PHV 25587-2022)  
Raisa M. Cramer (PHV 25880-2022)  
ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP  
10 G St NE, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20002  
T: (202) 968-4490  
F: (202) 968-4498  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
sklein@elias.law  
hgambhir@elias.law  
rcramer@elias.law

Donald J. McTigue\* (0022849)  
\**Counsel of Record*  
Derek S. Clinger (0092075)  
MCTIGUE COLOMBO & CLINGER LLC

Dave Yost  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Erik J. Clark (0078732)  
Ashley Merino (0096853)  
ORGAN LAW LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, OH 43215  
T: (614) 481-0900  
F: (614) 481-0904  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General  
Dave Yost

*Counsel for Respondent The Ohio  
Redistricting Commission*

Dave Yost  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Julie M. Pfeiffer (0069762)  
Jonathan D. Blanton (0070035)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Michael A. Walton (0092201)  
Michael J. Hendershot (0081842)  
Deputy Solicitor

545 East Town Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
T: (614) 263-7000  
F: (614) 368-6961  
dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com  
dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

*Counsel for Petitioners*

OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY  
GENERAL

30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 466-2872  
F: (614) 782-7592  
Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov  
Jonathan.Blanton@ohioAGO.gov

David A. Lockshaw, Jr. (0082403)  
Terrence O'Donnell (0074213)  
Manuel D. Cardona (0098079)  
DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC  
180 East Broad Street, Suite 3400  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 744-2570  
F: (844) 670-6009  
dlockshaw@dickinson-wright.com  
todonnell@dickinson-wright.com  
mcardona@dickinson-wright.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General  
Dave Yost

*Counsel for Respondent Secretary of State  
Frank LaRose*

John W. Zeiger (0010707)  
Marion H. Little, Jr. (0042679)  
Christopher J. Hogan (0079829)  
ZEIGER, TIGGES & LITTLE LLP  
3500 Huntington Center  
41 South High Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 365-9900  
zeiger@litohio.com  
little@litohio.com

*Counsel for Respondent Governor Mike  
DeWine*

Brodi J. Conover (0092082)  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
2 East Mulberry Street

Lebanon, Ohio 45036  
T: (513) 670-6693  
F: (513) 670-0999  
bconover@bricker.com

Anne Marie Sferra (0030855)  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 227-2300  
F: (614) 227-2390  
asferra@bricker.com

*Counsel for Respondent Auditor of State  
Keith Faber*

W. Stuart Dornette (0002955)  
Beth A. Bryan (0082076)  
Philip D. Williamson (0097174)  
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP  
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, OH 45202-3957  
T: (513) 381-2838  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

Phillip J. Strach  
Thomas A. Farr  
John E. Branch, III  
Alyssa M. Riggins  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
4140 Parklake Ave., Suite 200  
Raleigh, NC 27612  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
T: (919) 329-3812

*Counsel for Respondents Senate President Matt  
Huffman, House Speaker Robert Cupp, Senator  
Robert McColley, and Representative Jeffrey  
LaRe*

C. Benjamin Cooper (0093103)  
Charles H. Cooper, Jr. (0037295)  
Chelsea C. Weaver (0096850)  
COOPER & ELLIOTT, LLC  
305 West Nationwide Boulevard  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 481-6000  
benc@cooperelliott.com  
chipc@cooperelliott.com  
chelseaw@cooperelliott.com

*Counsel for Respondents Senator Vernon Sykes  
and House Minority Leader Allison Russo*

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

On May 25, 2022, this Court ordered the Ohio Redistricting Commission (the “Commission”) “to be reconstituted, to convene, and to draft and adopt an entirely new General Assembly–district plan that meets the requirements of the Ohio Constitution, including Article XI, Sections 6(A) and 6(B).” *League of Women Voters of Ohio v. Ohio Redistricting Comm.* (“LWV V”), Slip Opinion No. 2022-Ohio-1727, ¶ 5. The Court instructed the Commission to “file the district plan with the secretary of state no later than 9:00 a.m. on June 3, 2022, and in this court by 12:00 p.m. on the same date.” *Id.* ¶ 6. The Commission violated this order.<sup>1</sup>

During the period provided by this Court’s order, the Commission did not take *any* steps to comply with the Court’s order. It did not announce a single Commission meeting to discuss new proposals. It did not introduce any plans or solicit any public feedback. Indeed, to date, the Commission has not filed *anything*—a General Assembly districting plan, a motion for extension of time, or so much as an explanation to the Court for why the Commission violated the Court’s order—even though *four days* have now passed since the Commission’s June 3 deadline.

It is bad enough that the Commission has ignored an express order of this Court, but Petitioners respectfully submit that it is nothing less than shocking that the Commission has done so without even deigning to provide an excuse to this Court for its failure to comply with the Court’s deadline. The Court undoubtedly is authorized to set a deadline pursuant to its inherent power to manage its own docket and the progress of proceedings before it, *see, e.g., State ex rel. Davis v. Pub. Emps. Ret. Bd.*, 111 Ohio St. 3d 118, 2006-Ohio-5339, 855 N.E.2d 444, ¶ 18; Article IV, Section 2(B)(1)(f) of the Ohio Constitution, which “authorize[s] judgments . . . that are

---

<sup>1</sup> The Court had directed Petitioners to file objections, if any, to a new General Assembly plan no later than three days after the Commission’s adoption of a new plan. *LWV V* at ¶ 7. Given the Commission’s failure to comply with the Court’s order, Petitioners file this motion in lieu of objections.

necessary to achieve closure and complete relief in actions pending before the court,” *League of Women Voters of Ohio v. Ohio Redistricting Comm.* (“*LWV I*”), Slip Opinion No. 2022-Ohio-65, at ¶ 136; and R.C. 2503.40 (authorizing the Court to issue “other writs not specially provided for and not prohibited by law, when necessary to enforce the administration of justice”).

That is to say, the Court’s power to strike down General Assembly districting plans and order that a constitutional replacement plan be adopted by the Commission necessarily encompasses the power to order the Commission to do so in a timely fashion. Article XI, Section 9(B) not only empowers the Court to declare redistricting plans invalid, but provides that in the event the Court so finds, “then, notwithstanding any other provisions of this constitution, the commission *shall be reconstituted* as provided in Section 1 of this article, [to] convene, and ascertain and determine a general assembly district plan in conformity with such provisions of this constitution as are then valid[.]” (emphasis added). The Commission has no power to refuse to convene.

Indeed, the Commission’s actions illustrate the absurd results that would follow if the Court were *not* authorized to order the Commission to redraw a state legislative plan by a particular date. The Commission could refuse to reconvene following a Court order striking down a redistricting plan. By so doing, it could stall until “impasse” and then ask the federal courts to implement the previously adopted General Assembly plan that had been invalidated by the very institution that Ohio voters and the General Assembly itself authorized to review such plans. Namely, if the Court cannot set deadlines to ensure its orders are followed, its orders are nugatory. This Court does not interpret the Ohio Constitution to mandate such absurd results. *See State ex rel. Dispatch Printing Co. v. Wells*, 18 Ohio St.3d 382, 384, 481 N.E.2d 632 (1985) (“It is an axiom of judicial interpretation that statutes be construed to avoid unreasonable or absurd consequences.”); *Toledo*

*City Sch. Dist. Bd. of Educ. v. State Bd. of Educ.*, 146 Ohio St.3d 356, 2016-Ohio-2806, 56 N.E.3d 950, ¶ 16 (applying statutory construction rules to constitutional provisions).

This litigation has seen the Commission behave more and more lawlessly. Outright ignoring court orders is the stuff of authoritarianism—and doing so subverts the legitimacy of this Court and its role in the constitutional structure. From missing its September 2021 constitutional deadlines, to arguing that Section 6 is entirely aspirational, to declaring impasse in the face of a Court order, to passing previously invalidated plans, to now refusing to acknowledge this Court’s order at all, the Commission has never given Article XI force. This Court should not do the same. *See State v. Moore*, 154 Ohio St.3d 94, 2018-Ohio-3237, 111 N.E.3d 1146, ¶ 13, citing *State ex rel. Myers v. Spencer Twp. Rural School Dist. Bd. of Edn.*, 95 Ohio St. 367, 373, 116 N.E. 516 (1917) (“[W]e avoid construing a statute in a way that would render a portion of the statute meaningless or inoperative.”); R.C. 1.47(B) & (C) (“In enacting a statute, it is presumed that . . . the entire statute is intended to be effective [and that a] just and reasonable result is intended.”); Scalia & Garner, *Reading Law: The Interpretation of Legal Texts* 63 (2012) (“A textually permissible interpretation that furthers rather than obstructs the document’s purpose should be favored.”); *see also Miami Cty. v. Dayton*, 92 Ohio St. 215, 223, 110 N.E. 726 (1915) (explaining that rules of construction for statutes apply to Constitution).

Accordingly, Petitioners respectfully request that this Court (1) order Respondents to show cause at a hearing as to why they did not comply with the Court’s order and (2) again order Respondents to pass a constitutionally compliant plan by a date certain. Because the Commission violated the Court’s order without explanation, Petitioners do not know what excuse, if any, Respondents will proffer to the Court. Petitioners therefore respectfully request an opportunity to respond, as the Court determines appropriate, at the hearing and/or by filing a reply, within three

days, to any response filed to this motion.

If the Court finds that Respondents' explanation for why they did not comply with the Court's order is inadequate, then, in addition to the Court directing Respondents to take further action to comply with the Court's order, the Court has additional tools to address their failure to comply, as detailed in Petitioners' prior submissions to this Court, including finding the Commission and, as the Court deems proper, individual Respondents in contempt pursuant to R.C. 2705 and its inherent contempt power. The Court has declined to take such additional measures to date. Regrettably, it seems Respondents have no intention of complying with the Court's orders without further action from this Court.

Dated: June 7, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Donald J. McTigue

Donald J. McTigue\* (0022849)

*\*Counsel of Record*

Derek S. Clinger (0092075)

MCTIGUE COLOMBO & CLINGER LLC

545 East Town Street

Columbus, OH 43215

T: (614) 263-7000

F: (614) 368-6961

dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com

dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

Abha Khanna (PHV 2189-2021)

Ben Stafford (PHV 25433-2021)

ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP

1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100

Seattle, WA 98101

T: (206) 656-0176

F: (206) 656-0180

akhanna@elias.law

bstafford@elias.law

Jyoti Jasrasaria (PHV 25401-2021)

Spencer W. Klein (PHV 25432-2021)

Harleen K. Gambhir (PHV 25587-2022)

Raisa M. Cramer (PHV 25880-2022)



ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP  
10 G St NE, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20002  
T: (202) 968-4490  
F: (202) 968-4498  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
sklein@elias.law  
hgambhir@elias.law  
rcramer@elias.law

*Counsel for Petitioners*

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the foregoing was sent via email this 7th day of June, 2022 to the following:

Dave Yost  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Erik J. Clark (0078732)  
Ashley Merino (0096853)  
ORGAN LAW LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, OH 43215  
T: (614) 481-0900  
F: (614) 481-0904  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General Dave Yost

*Counsel for Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission*

Dave Yost  
OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL

Julie M. Pfeiffer (0069762)  
Jonathan D. Blanton (0070035)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Michael A. Walton (0092201)  
Michael J. Hendershot (0081842)  
Deputy Solicitor  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL  
30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 466-2872  
F: (614) 782-7592  
Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov  
Jonathan.Blanton@ohioAGO.gov

David A. Lockshaw, Jr. (0082403)  
Terrence O'Donnell (0074213)  
Manuel D. Cardona (0098079)  
DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC  
180 East Broad Street, Suite 3400

Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 744-2570  
F: (844) 670-6009  
dlockshaw@dickinson-wright.com  
todonnell@dickinson-wright.com  
mcardona@dickinson-wright.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General Dave Yost

*Counsel for Respondent Secretary of State Frank LaRose*

John W. Zeiger (0010707)  
Marion H. Little, Jr. (0042679)  
Christopher J. Hogan (0079829)  
ZEIGER, TIGGES & LITTLE LLP  
3500 Huntington Center  
41 South High Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 365-9900  
zeiger@litohio.com  
little@litohio.com

*Counsel for Respondent Governor Mike DeWine*

Brodi J. Conover (0092082)  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
2 East Mulberry Street  
Lebanon, Ohio 45036  
T: (513) 670-6693  
F: (513) 670-0999  
bconover@bricker.com

Anne Marie Sferra (0030855)  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 227-2300  
F: (614) 227-2390  
asferra@bricker.com

*Counsel for Respondent Auditor of State Keith Faber*

W. Stuart Dornette (0002955)  
Beth A. Bryan (0082076)  
Philip D. Williamson (0097174)  
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP

425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, OH 45202-3957  
T: (513) 381-2838  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

Phillip J. Strach  
Thomas A. Farr  
John E. Branch, III  
Alyssa M. Riggins  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH LLP  
4140 Parklake Ave., Suite 200  
Raleigh, NC 27612  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
T: (919) 329-3812

*Counsel for Respondents Senate President Matt Huffman, House Speaker Robert Cupp,  
Senator Robert McColley, and Representative Jeffrey LaRe*

C. Benjamin Cooper (0093103)  
Charles H. Cooper, Jr. (0037295)  
Chelsea C. Weaver (0096850)  
COOPER & ELLIOTT, LLC  
305 West Nationwide Boulevard  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
T: (614) 481-6000  
benc@cooperelliott.com  
chipc@cooperelliott.com  
chelseaw@cooperelliott.com

*Counsel for Respondents Senator Vernon Sykes and House Minority Leader Allison  
Russo*

/s/ Derek S. Clinger  
Derek S. Clinger (0092075)