

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
ATLANTA DIVISION**

ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING
JUSTICE-ATLANTA, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BRAD RAFFENSPERGER, in his
official capacity as the Georgia
Secretary of State, *et al.*,

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION

FILE NO. 1:21-CV-01333-JPB

**STATE DEFENDANTS' CONSOLIDATED¹ STATEMENT ON
CONSOLIDATION OF SB 202 CASES**

I. The SB 202 Cases involve common questions of law and fact and should be consolidated.²

Consolidation is available if “actions before the court involve a common question of law or fact.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a). The Eleventh Circuit also encourages “trial judges to ‘make good use of Rule 42(a) . . . in order to expedite the trial and eliminate unnecessary repetition and confusion.’” *Hendrix v.*

¹ In accordance with the Court’s December 9, 2021 minute order in this case, this same consolidated statement is filed in all eight of the SB 202 cases covered by the Court’s order with only the caption changed for each case.

² State Defendants have conferred with Intervenor-Defendants, who also support consolidation.

Raybestos-Manhattan, Inc., 776 F.2d 1492, 1495 (11th Cir. 1985) (quoting *Dupont v. Southern Pacific Co.*, 366 F.2d 193, 195 (5th Cir. 1966)).

These eight SB 202 cases share common questions of law or fact—in fact, many of them challenge the same practices, as the chart below demonstrates:

Topic area of challenge	NGP	Sixth AME	NAACP	Vote America	AAAJ	CBC	CGG	US
ABSENTEE BALLOTS								
Identification requirements for absentee ballot applications	X	X	X		X	X	X	X
Limiting absentee ballot application harvesting					X			
Timeframes for requesting and receiving absentee ballots	X				X	X	X	
Prohibition on governments mailing unsolicited absentee ballot applications	X		X		X			X
Penalties for sending absentee-ballot applications after voter already requested/voted a ballot	X	X	X	X	X			
Use of drop boxes for returning absentee ballot	X	X	X		X	X		
Disclaimer on absentee-ballot applications				X				
Prohibition on prefilled absentee-ballot applications				X				

Topic area of challenge	NGP	Sixth AME	NAACP	Vote America	AAAJ	CBC	CGG	US
Date of birth on absentee ballot envelope	X							
IN PERSON VOTING								
Changes to out-of-precinct provisional ballots	X	X	X			X		X
Limitations on interactions with voters in line	X	X	X			X		X
Limitations on mobile voting units	X	X				X		
Expansion of hours of early voting			X					
Penalties for violating ballot secrecy							X	
ELECTION ADMINISTRATION								
Removal of Secretary from SEB			X					
SEB authority over local election officials			X			X	X	
Timeline for early voting in runoff elections	X	X				X		
Prohibition on observations and estimating during tabulation							X	
Prohibition on photographing ballots							X	
VOTER REGISTRATION								
Clarification on number of voter challenges	X	X	X					

While State Defendants recognize that there are a variety of legal

theories (including that the practices cumulatively violate various constitutional and statutory provisions), the questions of *fact* about each practice will be similar.³ For example, all cases challenge absentee-ballot processes from SB 202 and all but two challenge in-person voting processes from SB 202. Consolidating these cases will not “adversely affect[] the substantial rights” of any party. *Wright v. Dougherty Cty.*, 358 F.3d 1352, 1354 (11th Cir. 2004) (quoting *Hargett v. Valley Fed. Sav. Bank*, 60 F.3d 754, 760 (11th Cir. 1995)). As discussed below, consolidating these cases will also result in efficiencies to expedite the handling of this case and eliminate repetition.

II. The timeline of 2022 elections favors consolidation.

The timeline for the 2022 elections should also be a factor. A copy of the Secretary of State’s 2022 State Elections and Voter Registration Calendar is attached as Exhibit A. Several dates are worth noting. First, while the general primary and nonpartisan general election is set for May 24, 2022, the voting process effectively begins on March 7, 2022 when voters may begin applying for absentee ballots. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-381(a)(1)(A). Registrars can then begin to send absentee ballots to voters on April 5, 2022. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384(a)(2). In-

³ In challenges to Florida’s election legislation, the Florida district court consolidated the cases for discovery purposes and later consolidated the cases for trial. See *League of Women Voters of Florida Inc. v. Lee*, Case No. 4:21-cv-00186-MW-MAF, ECF Nos. 92 (June 17, 2021) and 365 (Dec. 8, 2021).

person early voting for the general primary begins on May 2, 2022. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)(A).

The June 21, 2022 primary runoff election faces similar timelines, with the deadline for submitting an absentee ballot application of June 10, 2022, O.C.G.A. § 21-2-381(a)(1)(A), and in-person early voting beginning on June 13, 2022, O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)(B).

The voting process for the November 8, 2022 general election begins on August 22, 2022 when voters can apply for an absentee ballot. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-381(a)(1)(A). Absentee ballots can be mailed to voters beginning on September 20, 2022, with early voting beginning on October 17, 2022.

A. Availability of relief.

Since SB 202's passage, State Defendants have been implementing its provisions, including redesigning the absentee-ballot application, updating training materials for county election superintendents and registrars (and training them), and instituting a performance audit of at least one county's election processes. As the Court is aware, Plaintiffs seek major changes in those election processes. Any orders altering Georgia's statutory structure would require significant effort and place additional burdens on county election officials in their efforts to recruit and train pollworkers, which remains a challenge. *See Atlanta-Journal Constitution, Election depends on hiring many*

new poll workers across Georgia, <https://www.ajc.com/politics/election-depends-on-hiring-many-new-poll-workers-across-georgia/UPWQRQ6KXFAENAZFCBPSK6KTYI/> (Aug. 26, 2020).

As this Court is further aware, there are times when “an impending election is imminent and a [s]tate’s election machinery is already in progress.” *Coal. for Good Governance v. Kemp*, Case No. 1:21-cv-02070-JPB, ECF No. 37 (July 7, 2021). This Court has recognized the peril of changing rules between an election and a runoff. *Id.* Consolidation will minimize duplication of effort and help reach a resolution of this case to bring certainty for election officials.

B. Unique burdens on election officials in 2022.

In addition to the normal duties of an election year, election officials have once-in-a-decade responsibilities in 2022. The General Assembly recently passed new redistricting plans for the state House of Representatives, state Senate, and Congressional districts that now await the Governor’s signature. Local legislation to update boundaries for county commission and school board districts will be considered by the General Assembly beginning in January.

During early 2022, county and state election officials will be reassigning voters to new districts based on those changes—a process that only happens once every ten years. The time devoted to discovery in this case will take time away from the time election officials need to carry out their statutory

responsibilities. This likewise counsels in favor of consolidating the cases, so that duplication of effort and its required staff time can be avoided. For example, instead of the Secretary's office sitting for eight distinct Rule 30(b)(6) depositions on largely overlapping topics, the discovery process could proceed on a more efficient basis for all election officials if the cases are consolidated. Avoiding duplication also reduces the risk that these cases will affect the ability of election officials to administer the 2022 elections.

III. Advantages of a consolidated discovery process.

A consolidated discovery process offers distinct advantages, but the scope of discovery will also be relevant to the timeline for these cases. State Defendants offer several examples that might be of assistance to the Court and the parties.

A. Discovery in other voting cases in the Northern District.

Other voting cases in this Court have taken two distinct paths for discovery. First is the path trod by *Fair Fight Action v. Raffensperger* (1:18-cv-05391-SCJ), which was a wide-ranging challenge to Georgia election practices, and *Curling v. Raffensperger* (1:17-cv-02989-AT), which focuses on election technology. In those cases, plaintiffs sought extensive electronically stored information, requiring the review and production of hundreds of thousands to millions of pages of records. Both cases also saw dozens of experts between

them. And discovery took a long time—discovery opened in *Fair Fight Action* on July 15, 2019 [*FFA* Doc. 79, p. 2] and motions for summary judgment were not filed until June 29, 2020 [Doc. 441]. Likewise in *Curling*, discovery opened on May 21, 2019 [*Curling* Doc. 375, p. 61] and is still ongoing.

On the other side of the equation are *Georgia Coalition for the People's Agenda v. Raffensperger* (1:18-cv-04727-ELR), which deals with a single election practice, and *Rose v. Raffensperger* (1:20-cv-02921-SDG), which challenged the method of election for Public Service Commissioners. In each of those cases, discovery was targeted and primarily drew on expert testimony, allowing a much-more-efficient completion of the discovery process, including completion of all discovery in four months in *Rose*.

Consolidating these cases and requiring Plaintiffs to combine and narrow their discovery efforts provides the best path for reaching resolution of these cases. That being said, as the Court noted in its analysis of Plaintiffs' requirements to prove their standing allegations, State Defendants will still require discovery about each organizational and individual plaintiff—but that must take place regardless of consolidation.

B. Options for streamlining discovery.

Consolidation also offers the Court several options for streamlining the discovery process.

First, consolidation offers the ability to have combined document requests in a centralized database for all plaintiffs to access. In a consolidated discovery proceeding, the Court should require Plaintiffs to negotiate a limited number of document requests with accompanying search terms that would cover all the areas required for discovery. That would allow State Defendants to make a single review for privilege and responsiveness to document requests instead of requiring State Defendants to respond to document requests in each case, which could conceivably octuple the amount of attorney time required.

Second, the Court should take a page from mass-tort litigation and select individual SB 202 cases on certain topics for bellwether treatment. Bellwether trials can “assist in maturation of any given dispute by providing an opportunity for coordinating counsel to organize the products of pretrial common discovery, evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of their arguments and evidence, and understand the risks and costs associated with the litigation.” THE PROBLEM OF MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION: Bellwether Trials in Multidistrict Litigation, 82 Tul. L. Rev. 2323, 2338 (2008). For example, one case would be the bellwether on absentee-ballot processes and another would deal with in-person processes.⁴ This kind of approach would avoid duplication

⁴ For instance, *AAAJ* and *NGP* substantially overlap with other cases raising challenges to absentee voting. For in-person voting, *NGP*, *Sixth AME*, and

of effort and could form a central repository of documents and data that could narrow further litigation on the remaining cases after the bellwether case moves forward.

Third, the Court can limit the number of experts on each topic area. If the cases were not consolidated and each involved four experts, that would mean more than 30 expert reports and depositions would have to be conducted on largely overlapping topics. Consolidation and limitations on experts in each subject area would promote efficiency in the process of litigating these actions.

Fourth, the Court should hold a discovery conference with the parties as soon as possible to ensure efficiency in the discovery process.

CONCLUSION

This Court should consolidate all eight SB 202 cases, at least for purposes of discovery, and place reasonable limits on discovery to avoid duplication and undue burden in a year when State Defendants have numerous and important duties regarding the 2022 elections. Consolidation offers the best path to a resolution of the issues raised by Plaintiffs—and the certainty needed for voters and election officials.

NAACP overlap with all cases. Similarly, for election administration claims, *CBC* overlaps with several other cases. And for claims related to voter registration, *NGP*, *Sixth AME*, and *NAACP* raise similar claims

Respectfully submitted this 14th day of December, 2021.

Christopher M. Carr
Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 112505
Bryan K. Webb
Deputy Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 743580
Russell D. Willard
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 760280
Charlene McGowan
Assistant Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 697316
**Office of the Georgia Attorney
General**
40 Capitol Square, S.W.
Atlanta, Georgia 30334

/s/ Bryan P. Tyson

Bryan P. Tyson
Special Assistant Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 515411
btyson@taylorenghish.com
Bryan F. Jacoutot
Georgia Bar No. 668272
bjacoutot@taylorenghish.com
Loree Anne Paradise
Georgia Bar No. 382202
lparadise@taylorenghish.com
Taylor English Duma LLP
1600 Parkwood Circle
Suite 200
Atlanta, GA 30339
Telephone: 678-336-7249

Gene C. Schaerr*
gschaerr@schaerr-jaffe.com
Erik Jaffe*

ejaaffe@schaerr-jaffe.com
H. Christopher Bartolomucci*
cbartolomucci@schaerr-jaffe.com
Brian J. Field*
bfield@schaerr-jaffe.com
SCHAERR | JAFFE LLP
1717 K Street NW, Suite 900
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 787-1060
Fax: (202) 776-0136
* Admitted *pro hac vice*

Counsel for State Defendants

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

Pursuant to L.R. 7.1(D), the undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing STATE DEFENDANTS' CONSOLIDATED STATEMENT ON CONSOLIDATION OF SB 202 CASES has been prepared in Century Schoolbook 13, a font and type selection approved by the Court in L.R. 5.1(B).

/s/ Bryan P. Tyson
Bryan P. Tyson

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

EXHIBIT A

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM

2022 State Elections & Voter Registration Calendar

Elections	Voter Registration Deadline	Election Date
Special Election Date	February 14, 2022	March 15, 2022
Special Election Runoff Date	February 14, 2022	April 12, 2022
General Primary Election, Nonpartisan General Election and Special Election Date	April 25, 2022	May 24, 2022
General Primary Election, Nonpartisan General Election and Special Election Runoff Date	April 25, 2022	June 21, 2022
General Primary Election Runoff Date for Federal Races	May 23, 2022	June 21, 2022
General Election/Special Election Date	October 11, 2022*	November 8, 2022
General Election/Special Election Runoff Date	October 11, 2022*	December 6, 2022
General Election Runoff Date for Federal Races	November 7, 2022	December 6, 2022

Key Dates

January 1, 2022	Earliest day to file and publish a notice of intention to be a write-in candidate in the General Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-133(a)
January 13, 2022	Earliest day to circulate nomination petition for General Election for Independent/Political Body Candidates O.C.G.A. § 21-2-170(e)
February 1, 2022	Last day to fix and publish qualifying fees for offices to be filled during the 2022 Election Cycle. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-131(a)(1)(A)
February 14, 2022	Last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the March Special Election and Runoff Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-224
February 21, 2022	Earliest day for a registrar to mail an absentee ballot for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384(a)(2)
February 21, 2022	Advanced (Absentee In-Person) Voting begins for the March Special Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)(A)
February 26, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
February 27, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
March 4, 2022	Last day to submit absentee ballot application for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
March 5, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
March 6, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the March Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)

March 7, 2022	Earliest day to apply for an absentee ballot for the May General Primary Election O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
March 7, 2022 9:00 A.M.	Earliest day to qualify for Primary/Nonpartisan and Independent/Political Body Candidates for November General Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-153(c)(1)(A)
March 11, 2022 12:00 Noon	Last day to qualify for Primary/Nonpartisan and Independent/Political Body Candidates for November General Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-153(c)(1)(A)
March 18, 2022	Last day to file and publish a notice of intention to be a Non-Partisan Write-In Candidate. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-133(a)
March 23, 2022	Last day to file affidavit stating the notice of intention to be a Non-Partisan Write-In Candidate has been published in accordance with O.C.G.A. § 21-2-133(b)
April 1, 2022	Last day to submit absentee ballot application for the April Special Election Runoff O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
April 5, 2022	Earliest day for a registrar to mail an absentee ballot for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384(a)(2)
April 25, 2022	Last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election and Runoff Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-224
May 2, 2022	Advanced (Absentee In-Person) Voting begins for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)(A)
May 7, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
May 8, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
May 13, 2022	Last day to submit absentee ballot application for the May General Primary Election O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
May 14, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
May 15, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)
May 23, 2022	Last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the General Primary Runoff for Federal Races.
June 10, 2022	Last day to submit absentee ballot application for the June General Primary Runoff O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
June 13, 2022	Advanced (Absentee In-Person) Voting for the General Primary/Non-Partisan/Special Runoff Election must begin no later than this date. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)(B)
June 27, 2022 9:00 AM	Earliest day for an Independent or a Political Body Candidate to file their Nomination Petition to have his/her name placed on the General Election Ballot. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-132(e)
July 12, 2022 12:00 Noon	Last day for an Independent or a Political Body Candidate to file their Nomination Petition to have his/her name placed on the General Election Ballot. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-132(e)
August 22, 2022	Earliest day to apply for an absentee ballot for November General Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
September 6, 2022	Last day to file the notice of intention to be a write-in candidate and have notice published in accordance with O.C.G.A. § 21-2-133(a)
September 11, 2022	Last day to file affidavit stating the notice of intention to be a Write-In Candidate has been published in accordance with O.C.G.A. § 21-2-133(b)
September 20, 2022	Earliest day for a registrar to mail an absentee ballot for the November General/Special Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384(a)(2)
October 11, 2022	Last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the November General Election and Runoff Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-224(a) **October 10th is a State Holiday**

October 17, 2022	Advanced (Absentee In-Person) Voting begins for the November General Election. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)
October 22, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the November General Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)
October 23, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the November General Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)
October 28, 2022	Last day to submit absentee ballot application for the November General Election O.C.G.A. 21-2-381(a)(1)(A)
October 29, 2022	Mandatory Saturday Voting for the November General Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)
October 30, 2022	Optional Sunday Voting for the November General Election O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385(d)(1)
November 7, 2022	Last day for a person to register and be eligible to vote in the General Election Runoff for Federal Races.
As soon as possible	Absentee ballots shall be mailed out as soon as possible prior to the General Election Runoff for Local and State Offices. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-384 (a) - Advanced (In-Person) Voting begins for the General Election Runoff for Local and State Offices. O.C.G.A. § 21-2-385 (d)(1)

**O.C.G.A. § 21-2-14. When the last day for the exercise of any privilege or discharge of any duty prescribed or required by this chapter shall fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or legal holiday, the next succeeding business day shall be the last day for the exercise of such privilege or the discharge of such duty.*

RETRIEVED FROM DEMOCRACYDOCKET.COM